PCCP

# Accepted Manuscript



This is an *Accepted Manuscript*, which has been through the Royal Society of Chemistry peer review process and has been accepted for publication.

Accepted Manuscripts are published online shortly after acceptance, before technical editing, formatting and proof reading. Using this free service, authors can make their results available to the community, in citable form, before we publish the edited article. We will replace this Accepted Manuscript with the edited and formatted Advance Article as soon as it is available.

You can find more information about *Accepted Manuscripts* in the **Information for Authors**.

Please note that technical editing may introduce minor changes to the text and/or graphics, which may alter content. The journal's standard <u>Terms & Conditions</u> and the <u>Ethical guidelines</u> still apply. In no event shall the Royal Society of Chemistry be held responsible for any errors or omissions in this *Accepted Manuscript* or any consequences arising from the use of any information it contains.



www.rsc.org/pccp

# Isothermal transport properties and majority-type defects of BaCo<sub>0.70</sub>Fe<sub>0.22</sub>Nb<sub>0.08</sub>O<sub>3-δ</sub>

Taewon Lee<sup>a</sup>, Deok-Yong Cho<sup>b</sup>, Hyung-Soon Kwon<sup>a</sup>, and Han-Ill Yoo<sup>a\*</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Department of Materials Science and Engineering, Seoul National University, Seoul 151-744, Korea

<sup>b</sup> Department of Physics, Chonbuk National University, Jeonju 561-756, Korea

### Abstract

 $(Ba,Sr)(Co,Fe)O_{3-\delta}$  based mixed conducting oxides, e.g.  $(Ba_{0.5}Sr_{0.5})(Co_{1-x}Fe_x)O_{3-\delta}$  and  $Ba(Co_{0.7}Fe_{0.3-x}Nb_x)O_{3-\delta}$ are promising candidates for oxygen permeable membranes and SOFC cathodes due to their excellent ambipolar conductivities. Despite these excellent properties, however, their mass/charge transport properties have not been fully characterized and hence, their defect structure remains not clearly elucidated. Up until now, the majority types of ionic and electronic defects have been regarded as oxygen vacancies and localized holes. Holes, whether localized or not, are acceptable as majority electronic carriers on the basis of the as-measured total conductivity, which is essentially electronic, and electronic thermopower. On the other hand, the proposal of oxygen vacancies as majority ionic carriers lacks solid evidences. In this work, we document all the isothermal transport properties of  $Ba(Co_{0.70}Fe_{0.22}Nb_{0.08})O_{3-\delta}$  in terms of a 2×2 Onsager transport coefficient matrix and its steady-state electronic thermopower against oxygen activity at elevated temperatures, and determine the valences of Co and Fe via soft X-ray absorption spectroscopy. It turns out that the ionic and electronic defects in majority should be oxygen interstitials and at least two kinds of holes, one free and the other trapped. Furthermore, the lattice molecule should be  $Ba(Co_{0.7}Fe_{0.3-x}Nb_x)O_{2+\delta}$ , not  $Ba(Co_{0.7}Fe_{0.3-x}Nb_x)O_{3-\delta}$ , to be consistent with all the results observed.

**Keywords**:  $BaCo_{0.70}Fe_{0.22}Nb_{0.08}O_{3-\delta}$ , Defect types, Onsager matrix, Ionic/electronic conductivity, Thermopower, Ion-blocking method, X-ray absorption spectroscopy, Charge of transport

Corresponding author. Tel.: +82 2 8807163 E-mail address: <u>hiyoo@snu.ac.kr</u> (H.-I. Yoo)

### 1. Introduction

 $(Ba,Sr)(Co,Fe)O_{3-\delta}$  -based mixed conductors, e.g.  $(Ba_{0.5}Sr_{0.5})(Co_{1-x}Fe_x)O_{3-\delta}^{1-6}$  and  $Ba(Co_{0.7}Fe_{0.3-x}Nb_x)O_{3-\delta}^{7.8}$  have been attracting wide attention as promising materials for the oxygen separation membrane and SOFC cathode primarily due to their excellent ambipolar conductivities. Despite these promises, however, their mass/charge transport properties have not been fully characterized and their defect structure remains still not clearly elucidated.

Up until now, oxygen vacancies ( $V_0^{\bullet\bullet}$ ) and holes ( $h^{\bullet}$ ) have been believed to be the majority disorder types in these systems.<sup>2-8</sup> Holes, whether localized or not, are acceptable as the majority type of electronic carriers or disorders because the total conductivities as measured on these systems, that are essentially electronic, always increase with increasing oxygen activity at fixed temperatures<sup>3,6,7</sup> and the sign of electronic thermopower is always consistent with the p-type carriers<sup>6</sup>. Oxygen vacancies as the majority type of ionic carriers or disorders, on the other hand, lack experimental evidences. The only circumstantial evidence available is that the oxygen contents of these oxides are always found to be smaller than 3 per lattice molecule with reference to the ideal perovskite lattice molecule  $A^{2+}B^{4+}O_3$ , or (Ba,Sr)(Co,Fe)O<sub>3-δ</sub>.<sup>2,3,5,8</sup> Furthermore, if these  $V_0^{\bullet\bullet}$  and  $h^{\bullet}$  were the case indeed, there would have to be effectively negatively charged defects, e.g., acceptor impurities,  $A'_C$  for charge compensation such that

$$\left[A_{\rm C}^{\prime}\right] = 2\left[V_{\rm O}^{\bullet\bullet}\right] + p + \sum\left[M_{\rm B}^{\bullet}\right] \tag{1}$$

where [ ] stands for the concentration of the species therein,  $p \equiv [h^{\bullet}]$ , and  $M_B^{\bullet}$  for the possible trapped (or localized) holes on multivalent B-site cations (Co,Fe). The identity of  $A_C'$ , however, has never been questioned thus far.

One well established method to identify the majority types of ionic and electronic defects or carriers is to measure the partial ionic and electronic conductivity against oxygen activity at fixed temperatures. If oxygen vacancies are the majority ionic defects, the partial ionic conductivity will have to decrease with increasing oxygen activity as long as their mobility remains independent of their concentration as is generally the case; If holes are in the majority, the electronic partial conductivity also has to increase with increasing oxygen activity. Another way to identify the majority disorder types is to observe the partial ionic and electronic thermopower in

# Physical Chemistry Chemical Physics

In this work, we will first establish the isothermal Onsager-transport-coefficient-matrix, the most succinct representation of all the isothermal mass/charge transport properties of a mixed conductor<sup>10</sup>, for the system of BaCo<sub>0.70</sub>Fe<sub>0.22</sub>Nb<sub>0.08</sub>O<sub>3- $\delta$ </sub> (BCFN) in the oxygen activity range of  $-9.5 \le \log a_{O_2} \le -1$  at 750, 850, and 950 °C, respectively, by the ion-blocking polarization method<sup>11</sup>. The steady-state electronic thermopower is then measured at the same thermodynamic states. Furthermore, the valences of B-site variable-valence cations Co and Fe are determined by soft X-ray absorption spectroscopy (XAS) on the specimens quenched at different thermodynamic states. We will thereby identify the majority types of ionic and electronic carriers and propose the reference stoichiometric composition of the BCFN systems.

# 2. Theoretical background

### 2.1. Isothermal Onsager matrix

For the mixed conductor compound of present interest, BCFN, the mobile charged components are no doubt holes  $h^+$  (=h) and oxide ions  $O^{2-}$ (=i) for all the cations are practically immobile. Letting  $J_k$  and  $\nabla \eta_k$  denote the flux and electrochemical potential gradient, respectively, of the k(=i,h)-type charged component, all the isothermal mass/charge transport properties of the present system may then be succinctly condensed into or documented by a 2×2 Onsager transport coefficient matrix L such that<sup>10-12</sup>

$$\begin{pmatrix} J_{i} \\ J_{h} \end{pmatrix} = - \begin{pmatrix} L_{ii} & L_{ih} \\ L_{hi} & L_{hh} \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \nabla \eta_{i} \\ \nabla \eta_{h} \end{pmatrix},$$
(2)

where, due to Onsager<sup>13,14</sup>,

$$L_{ih} = L_{hi}.$$
 (3)

The L-matrix, thus, involves only 3 independent coefficients, which may easily be evaluated simply by measuring the three different transport properties, e.g., the total electrical conductivity ( $\sigma$ ), the (electronic)

conductivity with ion-transfer suppressed (  $\sigma'_e$  ), and the ionic charge-of-transport (  $\alpha^*_i$  ) as  $^{11,15,16}$ 

$$\sigma = F^{2} \left[ 2L_{ii} \left( 2 - \frac{L_{ih}}{L_{ii}} \right) + L_{hh} \left( 1 - 2\frac{L_{ih}}{L_{hh}} \right) \right]; \quad \sigma_{e}' = F^{2}L_{hh} \left( 1 - \frac{L_{ih}^{2}}{L_{ii}L_{hh}} \right); \quad \alpha_{i}^{*} = \frac{L_{ih}}{L_{ii}}, \quad (4)$$

where F denotes the Faraday constant.

It is noted<sup>17</sup> that

$$\mathbf{L}_{kk} = [\mathbf{k}]\mathbf{B}_{k} = \sum_{\mathbf{d}} [\mathbf{d}]\mathbf{B}_{\mathbf{d}}$$
(5)

where [k] and  $B_k$  represent the concentration of the k-type mobile charged component and its mechanical mobility at infinite dilution, respectively, and [d] and  $B_d$  the corresponding quantities of the d-type defects responsible for the charged component mobility  $B_k$ . For k=i(O<sup>2-</sup>), "d" can be interstitials O<sub>1</sub>" (d=I) and vacancies  $V_0^{\bullet\bullet}$  (d=V), and for k=h, electrons e' (d=n), holes h<sup>•</sup> (d=p), and trapped ones, e.g.,  $M_B^{\bullet}$ , if any. By measuring  $L_{kk}$  against oxygen activity at given temperatures, thus, one can identify the majority types of ionic and electronic defects by observing whether  $L_{kk}$  increases or decreases with increasing oxygen activity.

# 2.2. Electronic thermopower

The electronic thermopower  $\theta_h$  is generally defined as<sup>†9</sup>

$$\theta_{\rm h} = \frac{1}{\rm F} \left( \frac{\nabla \eta_{\rm h}}{\nabla \rm T} \right). \tag{6}$$

According to irreversible thermodynamics,9,18 the electronic thermopower at the steady state or Soret

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>†</sup> It is noted that here we employ the Wagner sign convention on thermopower<sup>9</sup> as defined in eqn (6), viz., + for electrons and – for holes. From the electrochemistry and thermodynamics view point, this is more logical and consistent in dealing with the ionic and electronic thermopowers of a mixed conductor.

# **Physical Chemistry Chemical Physics**

equilibrium is determined by the sum  $(\overline{S}_d)$  of the partial molar entropy  $\overline{S}_d$  and entropy-of-transport  $S_d^*$  of holes as defects (d=p) if p-type (p>>n), and by that of electrons as defects (d=n) if n-type (n>>p)‡ or

$$\theta_{h}^{st} = \begin{cases} -\frac{1}{F} \left( \overline{s}_{p} + s_{p}^{*} \right) & \text{if } p \gg n \\ +\frac{1}{F} \left( \overline{s}_{n} + s_{n}^{*} \right) & \text{if } n \gg p \end{cases}$$

$$(7)$$

In the ideal dilute solution regime of electronic defects, the partial molar entropy of defects of kind d(=n, p, trapped ones) is written in terms of their concentration [d] as<sup>9</sup>

$$S_d = S_d^0 - R \ln[d] \tag{8}$$

where  $S_d^0$  stands for the standard molar entropy of defects of kind d. In any case,  $\overline{\overline{S}}_d = \overline{S}_d + S_d^* > 0$  in general, thus, the sign of the steady state electronic thermopower  $\theta_h^{st}$  already indicates the identity of the electronic defects in majority.

# 3. Experimental

### 3.1. Ion-blocking cell

The specimen,  $BaCo_{0.70}Fe_{0.22}Nb_{0.08}O_{3-\delta}$  (BCFN) was prepared to have a relative density of ca. 96% and a mean grain size of 16±5 µm, via a conventional solid state reaction route, as detailed earlier.<sup>11</sup> The ion-blocking cell was constructed, as illustrated in Fig. 1, with a parallelepiped BCFN specimen, measuring the cross sectional area A=41.79±0.05 mm<sup>2</sup> and overall length L=12.540±0.005 mm, equipped with a pair of electronic probes (EP), Pt-wires (#1 at x=x. and #2 at x=x<sub>+</sub>), and a pair of ionic probes (IP), galvanic cells YSZ | Pt,  $a_{O_2}^{ref}$  (#3 at x=x. and #4 at x=x<sub>+</sub>) that are symmetrically implanted at a distance  $\ell$  (=x<sub>+</sub>-x<sub>-</sub>) apart in the reference oxygen activity ( $a_{O_2}^{ref}$ ) atmosphere.

 $<sup>\</sup>ddagger$  Here,  $n \equiv [e'](p \equiv [h^{\bullet}])$ , not to be confused with the subscript "n(p)" to denote  $e'(h^{\bullet})$  as defects.

# <sup>2</sup>hysical Chemistry Chemical Physics Accepted Manuscript

### (Fig. 1)

For the experimental details, the reader is referred to Ref. 11. The only difference from the earlier study<sup>11</sup> is that for the purpose of applying temperature gradients across the specimen to measure  $\theta_h^{st}$ , we have additionally attached a local heater, an alumina disk (13 mm diameter × 1 mm thickness) with 0.2 mm diameter Pt-resistance wires embedded, at the opposite side of the YSZ, and attached an S-type thermocouple at each of the inner probes (#1-4) to measure local temperatures. The cell was then hermetically sealed with a glass as before <sup>11</sup>. When a current is passed between the electrodes #5 and #6, the cell turns symmetrically ion-blocking unlike the earlier asymmetric configuration<sup>11</sup>, because the alumina disk (=heater) at the top and the YSZ disk at the bottom of the specimen both mechanically block the solid/gas oxygen exchange. The initial thermodynamic state of the system with respect to oxygen nonstoichiometry  $\delta$  was adjusted by coulometric titration through the electrolyte YSZ.

# 3.2. Isothermal, ion-blocking measurements

Ion-blocking polarization and subsequent depolarization were carried out by switching on a constant current I and off between the electrode #5 to #6, while monitoring the open-circuit-voltages (OCV), U between the pair of IPs (with reference to #3), V between the pair of EPs (with reference to #1), u<sub>+</sub> between EP #2 and IP #4 (with reference to the latter) at the position  $x_+[=(L+\ell)/2]$ , and u between EP #1 and IP #3 (with reference to the latter) at the position  $x_+[=(L+\ell)/2]$ . The procedure was repeated by changing the current direction: the positive direction of the current (I>0) was defined to be from Pt-electrode #5 to #6 (i.e., x>0 direction).

The information content of each OCV is all listed in Table 1, where  $\Delta \eta_k$  denotes the difference of  $\eta_k$  (k=i,h) across  $\ell$  (=x<sub>+</sub>-x<sub>-</sub>), and  $\mu_0(x)$  the oxygen chemical potential at the position x(=x<sub>+</sub> or x<sub>-</sub>).

**Table 1** Information contents of the OCVs monitored in the present galvanostatic chemical polarization under the symmetric ion blocking condition. Here,  $\mu_{O_2}^{ref} (= \mu_{O_2}^o + RT \ln a_{O_2}^{ref})$  denotes the oxygen chemical potential in the surrounding.

OCV	Information content	
U	$-\frac{\Delta \eta_i}{2F} \approx -\frac{\ell \nabla \eta_i}{2F}$	
V	$\frac{\Delta \eta_h}{F} \approx \frac{\ell \nabla \eta_h}{F}$	
u+	$\frac{1}{2F} \left[ \mu_{O}\left(x_{+}\right) - \frac{1}{2} \mu_{O_{2}}^{ref} \right]$	
u_	$\frac{1}{2F} \left[ \mu_{\mathrm{O}}\left(x_{-}\right) - \frac{1}{2} \mu_{\mathrm{O}_{2}}^{\mathrm{ref}} \right]$	

As shown in the table, by using the pairs of IPs and EPs arranged as illustrated in Fig. 1, one can measure all the driving forces and even local oxygen activity values as well. The three isothermal transport properties in eqn (4) were thus determined, via eqn (2), as<sup>11,15</sup>

$$\sigma = -\frac{I/A}{V_0/\ell} \quad ; \quad \alpha_i^* = -\left(\frac{\nabla \eta_i}{\nabla \eta_e}\right)_{J_i=0} = \left(\frac{2U}{V}\right)_{J_i=0}; \quad \sigma_e' = -\frac{\ell}{A} \left(\frac{I}{V}\right)_{J_i=0} \tag{9}$$

where  $V_0$  is the initial voltage jump between the pair of EPs upon switching on I at t=0 or the initial voltage drop upon switching off I at the steady state (t $\rightarrow\infty$  or t' = 0), and the subscript J<sub>i</sub>=0 means the steady state or  $t\rightarrow\infty$  with I on. One may further determine the chemical diffusion coefficient from the transient V(t) or U(t) by using their analytic solutions<sup>15</sup>, but that is out of the scope of the present paper. In the present operation, the current level was chosen in such a way that  $|u_+|\approx|-u_-|<3$  mV or the oxygen activity is varied across  $\ell$  only in the range  $\left|\log\left(a_{O_2} / a_{O_2}^{ref}\right)\right| < 0.05$ , thus one may assign the resulted transport properties to the thermodynamic state  $a_{O_2}^{ref}$  of the system BCFN.

# 3.3. Non-isothermal, thermopower measurements

The specimen was first fully equilibrated by short-circuiting the YSZ electrolyte in a prefixed  $a_{O_2}^{ref}$  atmosphere at a prefixed uniform temperature, and then the local heater was switched on while monitoring the temperatures at the positions x. and x<sub>+</sub>, T<sub>1</sub>(t) and T<sub>2</sub>(t), respectively, against time t by using the thermocouples located at the respective positions, and V(t) between EP #1 and #2 respectively at the same positions, see Fig. 1.

The present thermocell has the configuration of phases and temperatures,

$$\begin{array}{c|c} Pt(\#1) & BCFN & Pt(\#2) \\ T_0 & T_1 & T_2 & T_0 \end{array} \tag{I}$$

The OCV of the cell, V as measured at the common temperature  $T_0$  should, thus, be written as

$$V = \frac{\Delta \eta_h}{F} - \int_{T_1}^{T_2} \theta^{(Pt)} dT$$
(10)

where  $\theta^{(Pt)}$  stands for the absolute thermopower of Pt-leads that is well documented.<sup>19</sup> By correcting against  $\theta^{(Pt)}$  according to eqn (10),  $\Delta \eta_h(t)$  was obtained for given  $\Delta T(t)[=T_2(t)-T_1(t)]$ . The temperature differences applied were kept less than 7 K at maximum at a pre-fixed mean temperature. The steady state thermopower  $\theta_h^{st}$  was finally evaluated as the best-fitted value for the slope of  $\Delta \eta_h/F$  vs.  $\Delta T$  at the steady state or

$$\theta_{h}^{st} = \lim_{t \to \infty} \frac{1}{F} \left( \frac{\Delta \eta_{h}(t)}{\Delta T(t)} \right).$$
(11)

### 3.4. X-ray absorption spectroscopy

In order to identify the chemical states of multi-valent Fe and Co ions, soft x-ray absorption spectroscopy (XAS) was performed on the BCFN specimens with the defect structure frozen-in at different thermodynamic states. The parallelepiped specimens, measuring ca.  $5 \times 5 \times 3$  mm<sup>3</sup> cut out of the as-sintered pellet, were first equilibrated in three different oxygen activity atmospheres ( $\log a_{O_2} = -0.998 \pm 0.002$ ,  $-1.794 \pm 0.002$ , and  $-4.112 \pm 0.013$ ) at three different temperatures (750, 850, and 950 °C), and subsequently quenched to ca. -80 °C. Afterwards, the surface of each quenched specimen was ground off to a thickness of 0.5~1.0 mm in order to eliminate the possible

diffusion effect during quenching. (The diffusion distance during quenching was expected to be  $4\sqrt{\tilde{D}_0 t}$ <0.7 mm, by taking the time elapse during quenching t≤0.3 s and the upper bound of oxygen chemical diffusivity  $\tilde{D}_0 < 10^{-3} \text{ cm}^2/\text{s}$  on the basis of the ion-blocking polarization kinetics.) The specimens may, thus, be safely regarded as being frozen-in at the equilibrium defect structure corresponding to each thermodynamic condition of temperature and oxygen activity. For experimental details for quenching, see Ref. 20.

The XAS measurement was done at the Beam Line 2A in the Pohang Light Source, Pohang, Korea, using the total electron yield (TEY) mode. The sample chamber was baked at 120 °C for 6 hours to get ultrahigh vacuum (UHV;  $\sim 10^{-9}$  Torr) for the soft XAS measurement. We used linear beam polarization with incident x-rays perpendicular to the plane of a specimen. It is generally known that the probing depth of the TEY mode in soft XAS is approximately 10 nm, which is much larger than those ( $\sim 2$  nm) of other surface-sensitive techniques such as x-ray photoelectron spectroscopy or Auger electron spectroscopy. Therefore, the XAS spectra may be regarded as reflecting the electronic structure of the bulk BCFN, which is essentially free from the effect of surface reaction under UHV condition considering the temperature dependence of the surface oxygen exchange reaction and diffusion kinetics. The overall energy resolution was 0.1 eV.

### 4. Results and Discussions

### 4.1. Isothermal Onsager matrix

Fig. 2 shows the temporal variations of the OCVs,  $u_+(t)$ ,  $u_-(t)$ , U(t), and V(t) upon polarization in one direction (I<0) followed by de-polarization (I=0), and upon repetition in the opposite direction (I>0). It is noted in Fig. 2(a) that  $u_+(t)$  and  $u_-(t)$ , the measure of  $\mu_0(x)$  at  $x=x_+$  and  $x_-$ , respectively, are almost anti-symmetric or  $u_+(t)\approx-u_-(t)$ . This means that all the transport properties involved indeed remain almost constant under the small enough driving forces employed in the present study (V, U < 10 mV) as designed. The corresponding U(t) and V(t) are in perfect agreement with what have been repeatedly observed upon galvanostatic polarization/depolarization under the ion-blocking condition<sup>11,12</sup>.

# (Fig. 2)

The three different transport properties  $\sigma$ ,  $\sigma'_e$ , and  $\alpha^*_i$  are subsequently evaluated, according to eqn (9), from

Fig. 2(b) and summarized in Fig. 3 and Fig. 4.

It should be mentioned that the total conductivity  $\sigma$  was evaluated, via eqn (9), by using the instantaneous voltage changes V<sub>0</sub> at the moments of current-on and -off. Strictly speaking, the former corresponds to the uniform oxygen chemical potential or u<sub>+</sub>=u<sub>-</sub>=0, while the latter to a mean oxygen chemical potential at steady state,  $\bar{\mu}_0 = 2F\left(\frac{u_+ + u_-}{2}\right) + \frac{1}{2}\mu_{O_2}^{ref}$  with u<sub>+</sub>+u<sub>-</sub> $\approx 0$ . These two, of course, have turned out to be the same within

experimental error as designed. Furthermore, such  $\sigma$  is in agreement within 10 % with  $\sigma^{ref}$ , the total electrical conductivity as measured independently on the different specimen of the same composition via dc 4-probe method<sup>11</sup>. The ionic charge-of-transport, the measure of electron-ion interference effect<sup>16</sup>, takes a value in the range of  $0.19 \le \alpha_i^* \le 0.32$ , also in agreement with the earlier report<sup>11</sup>.

Via eqn (4) from these  $\sigma$ ,  $\sigma'_e$ , and  $\alpha^*_i$ , the Onsager transport coefficients  $L_{ii}$ ,  $L_{hh}$  and  $L_{ih}(=L_{hi})$  are all evaluated across the entire range of the phase stability and documented in Fig. 5. It is seen that the earlier results, only in the limited range<sup>11</sup>, are in acceptable agreement.

Once the isothermal Onsager matrix is given as now, one can then calculate all the isothermal mass/charge transport properties (with the aid of the thermodynamic factor for the case of  $\tilde{D}_0$ ).<sup>10,21</sup> For example, the partial ionic and electronic conductivities§,  $\sigma_i$  and  $\sigma_h$ , respectively, as measured in the reversible electrode condition, thus, at the uniform composition, may be calculated as<sup>11,15</sup>

$$\sigma_{i} = 4F^{2}L_{ii}\left(1 - \frac{L_{ih}}{2L_{ii}}\right) ; \ \sigma_{h} = F^{2}L_{hh}\left(1 - 2\frac{L_{ih}}{L_{hh}}\right).$$
(12)

<sup>§</sup> Note that if  $\alpha_i^* \neq 0$ ,  $\sigma_h \neq \sigma'_h$  and likewise,  $\sigma_i \neq \sigma'_i$ .<sup>16,22</sup>

The results are as shown in Fig. 6.

### (Fig. 6)

It is noted that  $L_{ii}$  or  $\sigma_i$  and  $L_{hh}$  or  $\sigma_h$  are all increasing with increasing oxygen activity: the former rather monotonically, but the latter rather nonmonotonically with an inflection approximately in the middle.

### 4.2. Steady-state electronic thermopower

When the heater is on with a preset power (see Fig. 1),  $\Delta T(=T_2 - T_1)$  and induced V develop against time as shown in Fig. 7(a) and (b), respectively. Such V(t) is then corrected against the thermovoltage of the Pt-lead wires according to eqn (10), resulting in  $\Delta \eta_h [=\eta_h(T_2) - \eta_h(T_1)]$  as shown in Fig. 7(c). One can see that all the signals eventually achieve the steady state value. Such operation was repeated at different steady-state  $\Delta T'$ s to have a steady state data set { $\Delta T$ ,  $\Delta \eta_h$ } as shown in Fig. 8. The slopes of these plots finally give the steady state thermopowers, which are all collected in Fig. 9.

(Fig. 7),	
(Fig. 8),	
(Fig 9)	

It is noted that the electronic thermopower has negative sign all the way across the entire range and apparently show a hump at each temperature.

# 4.3. Chemical states of Co and Fe

Fig. 10 shows the Co L<sub>3</sub>-edge XAS spectra of the specimens frozen-in at (a)  $\log a_{O_2} = -0.998 \pm 0.002$ , (b)  $\log a_{O_2} = -1.794 \pm 0.002$ , and (c)  $\log a_{O_2} = -4.112 \pm 0.013$ , respectively. It is well known<sup>23</sup> that the sharp and strong absorption at ~785 eV is attributed to the Ba M<sub>5</sub>-edge absorption (Ba  $3d_{5/2} \rightarrow p$ ), indicating that the valence of Ba ions is fixed at +2 irrespective of defect structures frozen-in. The features at 778 ~ 783 eV are the signals from the Co L<sub>3</sub>-edge absorption: Many peaks here are due to electron correlation effects in the Co d shell<sup>24</sup>. For the identification of those multiplets, the spectra of CoO and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> powders, taken from Ref. 25, are included

in Fig. 10(a). In the case of rocksalt-structure CoO, a  $\text{Co}^{2+}$  ion with 7 d-electrons is coordinated by an oxygen octahedron.<sup>24</sup> The many-body Coulomb interactions between the 7 d-electrons as well as with the  $2p_{3/2}$  core holes result in a complicated peak split as exhibited in the spectrum of CoO. Meanwhile, in the case of  $\text{Co}_3\text{O}_4$  spinel, 1/3 of the Co ions are divalent with tetrahedral coordination while the rest 2/3 are trivalent with octahedral coordination.<sup>26</sup> Therefore, two peaks (for  $\text{Co}^{2+}$  and  $\text{Co}^{3+}$ ) should largely appear in the spectrum of  $\text{Co}_3\text{O}_4$ .

The Co-spectra of the sample frozen-in in the most oxidizing atmosphere ( $\log a_{O_2} = -0.998\pm0.002$ ) evolve the most actively with temperature, see Fig. 10(a). At 750 °C, the spectrum appears rather like that of Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>, suggesting the abundance of Co<sup>3+</sup> ions: By fitting the as-measured spectra as superposition of those of CoO and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>, the concentration ratio [Co<sup>2+</sup>]/[Co<sup>3+</sup>] is roughly estimated to be 35/65. As the temperature increases, however, the spectrum grows more similar to that of CoO, suggesting the gradual prevalence of Co<sup>2+</sup> ions. The signatures of Co<sup>2+</sup> are indicated by arrows in Fig. 10(a). The [Co<sup>2+</sup>]/[Co<sup>3+</sup>] ratio is then roughly estimated to be ca. 65/35 at both 850 and 950 °C. This demonstrates unambiguously that Co<sup>2+</sup> becomes more and more prevailing with increasing temperature at a fixed oxygen activity, in accord with the general trend of reduction of an oxide. Meanwhile, for the case of the specimens frozen-in in more reducing atmospheres ( $\log a_{O_2} =$ - $1.794\pm0.002$  and -4.112±0.013), such spectral evolution with temperature has become much attenuated, see Figs. 10(b) and (c). All the spectra there are more similar to that of CoO, suggesting the dominance of Co<sup>2+</sup> with decreasing  $a_{O_2}$ . We may therefore conclude that (i) Co ions have valences of either +2 or +3, but not +4, and (ii) [Co<sup>2+</sup>] tends to increase with increasing temperature and decreasing oxygen activity in agreement with the general tendency of oxide reduction. The overwhelming existence of Co<sup>2+</sup> ions strongly suggests the stability of a highly oxygen-deficient perovskite phase A<sup>2+</sup>B<sup>2+</sup>O<sub>2</sub>.

# (Fig. 10)

Fig. 11 shows the Fe L<sub>3</sub>-edge XAS spectra of the specimens frozen-in in the same oxygen activity atmospheres as above, viz., (a)  $\log a_{O_2} = -0.998\pm0.002$ , (b)  $\log a_{O_2} = -1.794\pm0.002$  and (c)  $\log a_{O_2} = -4.112\pm0.013$ . Contrary to the case of the Co L<sub>3</sub>-edge XAS, the Fe L<sub>3</sub>-edge spectra are very similar to each other. For comparison purpose, the spectra of "FeO" and  $\alpha$ -Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> (taken from Ref. 25) are added in Fig. 11(c). All the

# **Physical Chemistry Chemical Physics**

spectra are almost like that of Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>, indicating the dominance of Fe<sup>3+</sup>. At the highest temperature 950 °C in the most reducing atmosphere ( $\log a_{O_2} = -4.112 \pm 0.013$ ), however, there start to appear the features of Fe<sup>2+</sup> (similar to "FeO") as indicated by the arrows, but [Fe<sup>2+</sup>]/[Fe3+]≤0.1. One can, thus, conclude that Fe ions remain mostly trivalent in all cases.

### (Fig. 11)

The present findings are consistent with the literature. Yi et al.<sup>27</sup> reported that the valences of Co are +2 and +3, and an average valence of Fe is about +3.1 at 900 °C in  $BaCo_{1-x-y}Fe_xNb_yO_{3-\delta}$  systems. Harvey et al.<sup>28</sup> also reported that Co has the valence of +2 and +3 while Fe has nearly unchanged valence of +3 at the temperature ranging from 300 to 1223 K in  $Ba_{1-x}Sr_xCo_{1-y}Fe_yO_{3-\delta}$  systems.

# 4.4. Ionic defects in majority

We have observed in Fig. 5 that  $L_{ii}$  of the present system increases with oxygen activity. For better resolution, we replot, notwithstanding the redundancy,  $L_{ii}$  in Fig. 12. It unambiguously increases monotonically even though the increasing rate is small. Recalling eqn (5) and the fact that the mechanical mobility of a type of carriers at infinite dilution is constant, this fact no doubt indicates the ionic carrier concentration is increasing as oxygen activity increases. It is, therefore, unavoidable to conclude that the ionic carriers of the present system should be oxygen interstitials ( $O_1''$ ), not vacancies ( $V_0^{\bullet\bullet}$ ), across the entire ranges of thermodynamic variables examined.

# (Fig. 12)

### 4.5. Electronic defects in majority

It is reminded that  $L_{hh}$  also increases with increasing oxygen activity (Fig. 5). For a better resolution, we re-plot, despite the redundancy,  $L_{hh}$  in Fig. 13 together with its first derivative ( $\partial \log L_{hh} / \partial \log a_{O_2}$ ) at, e.g., 950 °C. Furthermore, the sign of the steady state electronic thermopower is negative (Fig. 9) all the way. These two facts clearly indicate that the electronic carriers are positively charged or p-type carriers. The possible carriers in the present system involving multivalent cations on B-sites (M<sub>B</sub>) may be delocalized holes (h<sup>•</sup>) and localized holes

 $(M_{B}^{\bullet}, M_{B}^{\bullet\bullet}, and the like).$ 

It is emphasized that  $L_{hh}$  exhibits an inflection at each temperature, where the local slope becomes minimum, see Fig. 13. This suggests that there are at least two kinds of p-type carriers, one dominating before the inflection and the other after the inflection.

## (Fig. 13)

This scenario is strongly supported by the presence of a hump upon each thermopower isotherm, see Fig. 9. When there are two types of electronic carriers, say, electrons and holes, for example, the electronic thermopower is given by the fractional sum of the two contributions  $or^{9,18,30}$ 

$$\theta_{h} = \sum_{d=n,p} \left( \frac{\sigma_{d} \theta_{d}}{\sum_{d} \sigma_{d}} \right)$$
(13)

where  $\sigma_d$  is the partial electrical conductivity due to the d-kind electronic defects. As  $n \propto p^{-1} \propto \ln a_{O_2}^{-m}$  with the oxygen exponent m>0, in the mixed conducting region of oxygen activity, substitution of eqn (7), (8) into eqn (13) renders the electronic thermopower to vary against oxygen activity as shown schematically in Fig. 14(a) and this is actually what have been repeatedly observed on the systems of e.g., PbS<sup>31</sup>, Gd-doped CeO<sub>2</sub><sup>32,33</sup>, and BaTiO<sub>3</sub><sup>18,34</sup>. Now, if there are two kinds of p-type carriers, say, d=p<sub>1</sub> and p<sub>2</sub>, then one may easily expect that the electronic thermopower will vary, while keeping the same sign(<0), as shown in Fig. 14(b)¶ again due to eqn (7), (8) and (13). This is actually what is seen in Fig. 9. These two possible kinds for the system in question are highly likely free holes (h<sup>•</sup>) and trapped holes (M<sup>•</sup><sub>p</sub>).

# (Fig. 14)

<sup>¶</sup> In this case, the oxygen exponents for  $[p_1]$  and  $[p_2]$  may differ from each other, thus,  $\theta_{p1}$  and  $\theta_{p2}$  appear to have different slopes in this figure.

### 4.6. Stoichiometric composition

We have come to know about the present system BCFN that A-site cation Ba has the fixed valence of +2, B-site cations M(=Co and Fe) have only two charge states,  $M^{2+}$  and  $M^{3+}$ , the ionic defects in majority are oxygen interstitials  $O_1''$ , the electronic defects are at least of two kinds, itinerant holes  $h^{\bullet}$  and trapped holes  $M_B^{\bullet} \left[ = \left( M_B^x, h^{\bullet} \right)^{\bullet} \right]$ . Oxygen interstitials suggest the present system must be hyperstoichiometric or with an oxygen excess over the stoichiometric composition, but the conventionally accepted, stoichiometric lattice molecule BaCo<sub>0.70</sub>Fe<sub>0.22</sub>Nb<sub>0.08</sub>O<sub>3</sub> would be by no means hyperstoichiometric, but always hypostoichiometric for the ideal perovskite lattice Ba<sup>2+</sup>B<sup>4+</sup>O<sub>3</sub> does not allow  $O_1''$  becasue it is energetically too expensive<sup>35</sup>. Furthermore, there can be no trapped holes  $M_B^{\bullet}(=Co_B^{5+}, Fe_B^{5+})$ . What should then be the stoichiometric lattice molecule in order to be consistent with all of the present findings?

One may then consider  $Ba^{2+}B^{3+}O_{2.5}$  like an end member of the solution  $SrTi_{1-x}Fe_xO_{3-x/2}$  with  $O_1''$ ,  $Sr^{2+}Fe^{3+}O_{2.5+\delta}^{-36}$ . For the trapped holes, there should be  $M_B^{4+}$ , but we have failed to see any, thus this possibility should be ruled out. The only remaining possibility will then be  $Ba^{2+}(Co_{1-x}^{2+}Fe_x^{2+})O_2$ . The structurally empty O-sites (1 per lattice molecule) in the virtual perovskite structure ABO<sub>3</sub> are now considered to be the interstitial sites for  $O_1''$ , and  $M_B^{\bullet}(=Co_B^{3+}, Fe_B^{3+})$  to be the trapped holes, thus, satisfying all the experimental findings. The charge neutrality may then be written as

$$[O_i''] = \frac{3}{2} \left[ N b_B^{\bullet \bullet \bullet} \right] + \frac{1}{2} \left[ h^{\bullet} \right] + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{M=Co,Fe} \left[ M_B^{\bullet} \right].$$
(14)

Here, the valence charge of Nb is regarded as +5.<sup>27</sup> Thence, the reference stoichiometric lattice molecule of the present system should be written as

$$Ba(Co_{0.70}Fe_{0.22}Nb_{0.08})O_{2.12}.$$
(15)

Of course, the defect structure can be completely explained on the basis of this stoichiometric composition, which will the subject of a forthcoming paper. It should, however, be mentioned that this is only a proposal to

explain the defect structure at this stage and obviously more elaborate structural study should be followed to confirm the proposal, eqn (15).

### 5. Summary and Conclusions

We have established completely the isothermal Onsager transport coefficient matrix for the system of nominal composition  $Ba(Co_{0.70}Fe_{0.22}Nb_{0.08})O_{3-\delta}$ , a best oxygen separation membrane material, in its entire stability range at elevated temperatures of practical interest. All the isothermal transport properties of the system, including the ambipolar conductivity can now be derived from this matrix.

The partial ionic conductivity at infinite dilution, as derived against oxygen activity, indicates that the majority ionic defects are oxygen interstitials, contrary to the conventional lattice molecule representation  $Ba(Co_{0.70}Fe_{0.22}Nb_{0.08})O_{3-\delta}$ . The partial electronic conductivity at infinite dilution as derived and the steady state electronic thermopower as measured against oxygen activity indicates that the electronic defects in majority are p-type carriers of at least two kinds, viz., itinerant and trapped holes. XAS study has shown that the multi-valent Co and Fe take +2 and +3 depending on the thermodynamic states with Ba fixed at +2. In order to be consistent with all these findings, the lattice molecule should be  $A^{2+}B^{2+}O_2$ -based  $Ba(Co_{0.70}Fe_{0.22}Nb_{0.08})O_{2.12+\delta}$ .

### References

- 1 Z. Shao and S.M. Haile, *Nature*, 2004, **431**, 170-173.
- S. McIntosh, J.F. Vente, W.G. Haije, D.H.A. Blank, and H.J.M. Bouwmeester, *Solid State Ionics*, 2006, 177, 1737-1742.
- 3 E. Bucher, A. Egger, P. Ried, W. Sitte, and P. Holtappels, Solid State Ionics, 2008, 179, 1032-1035.
- 4 W.-K. Hong and G.-M. Choi, J. Membr. Sci., 2010, 346, 353-360.
- 5 R. Kriegel, R. Kircheisen, and J. Töpferet, Solid State Ionics, 2010, 181, 64-70.
- 6 J.-I. Jung, S.T. Misture, and D.D. Edwards, Solid State Ionics, 2012, 206, 50-56.
- 7 Y. Cheng, H. Zhao, D. Teng, F. Li, X. Lu, and W. Ding, J. Membr. Sci., 2008, 322, 484-490.
- 8 Y. Li, H. Zhao, N. Xu, Y. Shen, X. Lu, W. Ding, and F. Li, J J. Membr. Sci., 2010, 362, 460-470.
- 9 C. Wagner, Prog. Solid State. Chem., 7, 1972, 1-37.
- 10 H.-S. Kim and H.-I. Yoo, Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys., 2010, 12, 12951–12955.
- 11 T. Lee and H.-I. Yoo, Solid State Ionics, 2013, 241, 5-11.

- 12 T. Lee. H.-S. Kim, and H.-I. Yoo, Solid State Ionics, 2014, 262, 2-8.
- 13 L. Onsager, Phys. Rev., 1931, 37, 405-426.
- 14 D.-K. Lee and H.-I. Yoo, Phys. Rev. Lett., 2006, 97, 255901/1-255901/4.
- 15 K.-C. Lee and H.-I. Yoo, J. Phys. Chem. Solids., 1999, 60, 911-927.
- 16 H.-I. Yoo, H. Schmalzried, M. Martin, and J. Janek, Z. Phys. Chem. N. F., 1990, 168, 129-142.
- 17 H.-I. Yoo and J.-H. Lee, J. Phys. Chem. Solids, 1996, 57, 65-73.
- 18 H.-I. Yoo and C.-R. Song, J. Electroceram., 2001, 6(1), 61–74.
- 19 N. Cusack and P. Kendall, Proc. Phys. Soc. (London), 1958, 72(6), 898-901.
- 20 H.-I. Yoo, T.-S. Oh, H.-S. Kwon, D.-K. Shin, and J.-S. Lee, *Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys.*, 2009, **11**, 3115-3126.
- 21 H.-I. Yoo and H.-S. Kim, Solid State Ionics, 2012, 225, 166-171.
- 22 C. Wagner, Prog. Solid State Chem., 1975, 10, 3-16.
- M. García-Fernández, V. Scagnoli, U. Staub, A.M. Mulders, M. Janousch, Y. Bodenthin, D. Meister, B. D. Patterson, A. Mirone, Y. Tanaka, T. Nakamura, S. Grenier, Y. Huang, and K. Conder, *Phys. Rev. B*, 2008, 78, 054424/1-054424/13.
- 24 J. van Elp, J.L. Wieland, H. Eskes, P. Kuiper, G.A. Sawatzky, F.M.F. de Groot, T. S. Turner, *Phys. Rev. B*, 1991, 44, 6090-6103.
- 25 C.L. Chen, C.L. Dong, S.M. Rao, G. Chern, M.C. Chen, M.K. Wu, and C.L. Chang, J. Phys.: Condens. Matter, 2008, 20, 255236/1-255236/4.
- 26 W.L. Roth, J. Phys. Chem. Solids, 1964, 25, 1-10.
- 27 J. Yi, J. Brendt, M. Schroeder, and M. Martin, J. Membr. Sci., 2012, 387-388, 17-23.
- 28 A.S. Harvey, F.J. Litterst, Z. Yang, J.L. M. Rupp, A. Infortuna, and L.J. Gauckler, *Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys.*, 2009, **11**, 3090-3098.
- 29 T. Lee and H.-I. Yoo, ECS Trans., 2013, 57(1), 1709-1718.
- 30 H.-I. Yoo, D.-S. Sinn, and J.-O. Hong, J. Eletrochem. Soc., 1998, 145(3), 1008-1016.
- 31 G.H. Jonker, Philips Research Reports, 1968, 23, 131-138.
- 32 H.L. Tuller and A.S. Nowick, J. Phys. Chem. Solids, 1977, 38, 859-867.
- 33 S.-H. Park and H.-I. Yoo, Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys., 2009, 11, 391-401.
- 34 H.-I. Yoo, C.-R. Song, and D.-K. Lee, J. Electroceram., 2002, 8, 5-36.

- 35 G.V. Lewis and C.R.A. Catlow, Rad. Effects, 1983, 73, 307-314.
- 36 A. Rothschild, W. Menesklou, H.L. Tuller, and E. Ivers-Tiffeé, Chem. Mater., 2006, 18, 3651-3659.

# **Figure Captions**

Fig. 1 Schematic of the as-constructed cell with the lateral surface hermatically sealed with a glass for the. •••• , local heater; , porous Pt-paste; , Pt gauze; , Pt-wire; , Pt/Rh-wire; 1 & 2, electronic probes; 3 & 4, ionic probes; 5 & 6, current leads; L, total length of the specimen;  $\ell$ , inter-probe distance;  $a_{O_2}^{ref}$ , reference oxygen activity.

**Fig. 2** Typical temporal variations of (a)  $u_+$ ,  $u_-$  and (b) U, V upon repeated polarizations (I=-25 mA and 25 mA) and subsequent depolarization (I=0) at 850 °C in the ambient of log  $a_{0_2}^{ref} = -3.442 \pm 0.003$ .

**Fig. 3** Total conductivities as determined by the 4-probe dc method  $(\sigma^{\text{ref}})^{11}$ , from the instantaneous voltage jump/drop upon polarization/depolarization ( $\sigma$ ) and the (electronic) conductivity with ionic transfer suppressed ( $\sigma'_e$ ) vs. oxygen activity at (a) 950, (b) 850, and (c) 750 °C.

**Fig. 4** Ionic charge-of- transport,  $\alpha_i^*$  vs. oxygen activity at (a) 950, (b) 850 ,and (c) 750 °C. Circle, asmeasured in this work; triangle, as- reported in previous work<sup>11</sup>.

Fig. 5 Isothermal Onsager transport coefficients  $L_{mn}(m,n=i,h)$  vs. oxygen activity of  $BaCo_{0.7}Fe_{0.22}Nb_{0.08}O_{3-\delta}$  at (a) 950, (b) 850, and (c) 750 °C. Closed symbols, as-measured in this work; open symbols, as-reported in earlier work<sup>11</sup>.

Fig. 6 Ionic ( $\sigma_{ion}$ ) and electronic ( $\sigma_{el}$ ) conductivities in the reversible electrode condition vs. oxygen activity of BaCo<sub>0.7</sub>Fe<sub>0.22</sub>Nb<sub>0.08</sub>O<sub>3-8</sub> at 950, 850, and 750 °C.

Fig. 7 Typical temporal variations of (a)  $\Delta T$ , (b) V, and (c)  $\Delta \eta_h / F$  corrected by using eqn (10) during heating (heater-on) and subsequent cooling (heater-off) at 850 °C in  $\log a_{O_2} = \log a_{O_2}^{ref} = -3.442 \pm 0.003$ . Where  $\Delta T = T_1 - T_2$ .

Physical Chemistry Chemical Physics Accepted Manuscript

Fig. 8  $\Delta \eta_h / F$  obtained at the steady state vs. steady state  $\Delta T$  at 850 °C in  $\log a_{O_2} = \log a_{O_2}^{ref} = -3.442 \pm 0.003$ . Symbol, as-measured values; solid line, best-fitted the slope of which is the steady state electronic thermopower ( $\theta_h^{st}$ ).

Fig. 9 Steady-state electronic thermopower vs. oxygen activity at 950, 850, and 750 °C. Note the sign  $\theta_h^{st} < 0$  and a hump on each isotherm.

**Fig. 10** Co L<sub>3</sub>-edge XAS spectra of BCFN with their defect structures frozen-in at the 950, 850, and 750 °C, respectively, in the surrounding of  $\log a_{O_2} = -0.998 \pm 0.002$  (a),  $\log a_{O_2} = -1.794 \pm 0.002$  (b) and  $\log a_{O_2} = -4.112 \pm 0.013$  (c), respectively, and those of CoO and Co<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub> powders<sup>25</sup> for comparison. Note a clear evolution of the Co<sup>2+</sup>-signatures (arrows) out of Co<sup>3+</sup> with increasing temperature and decreasing oxygen activity and no other species than Co<sup>2+</sup> and Co<sup>3+</sup>.

Fig. 11 Fe L<sub>3</sub>-edge XAS spectra of BCFN with their defect structures frozen-in at the 950, 850, and 750 °C, respectively, in the surrounding of  $\log a_{O_2} = -0.998 \pm 0.002$  (a),  $\log a_{O_2} = -1.794 \pm 0.002$  (b) and  $\log a_{O_2} = -4.112 \pm 0.013$  (c), respectively, and those of "FeO" and  $\alpha$ -Fe<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> powders<sup>25</sup> for comparison. Note that Fe ions remain mostly trivalent for all the samples.

**Fig. 12** Direct Onsager coefficient for oxygen ion  $(L_{ii})$  vs. oxygen activity at 950, 850, and 750 °C. Note that  $L_{ii}$  increases monotonically with increasing oxygen activity.

Fig. 13 Direct Onsager coefficient for holes ( $L_{hh}$ ) and its first derivative vs. oxygen activity at 950 °C.<sup>29</sup> Note that  $L_{hh}$  increases with oxygen activity, but exhibiting an inflection at each temperature.

Fig. 14 Expected steady-state electronic thermopower vs. oxygen activity (a) for an electron (n)-hole (p) mixed conductor and (b) for a p-type conductor but with two different kinds  $p_1$ ,  $p_2$ .  $\theta_k$  and  $\sigma_k$  denote the partial thermopower and conductivity, respectively, of electronic carriers of type  $k(=n,p,p_1,p_2)$ .

# **Table Caption**

**Table 1** Information contents of the OCVs monitored in the present galvanostatic chemical polarization underthe symmetric ion blocking condition. Here,  $\mu_{O_2}^{ref} (= \mu_{O_2}^o + RT \ln a_{O_2}^{ref})$  denotes the oxygen chemical potential inthe surrounding.