

This is an *Accepted Manuscript*, which has been through the Royal Society of Chemistry peer review process and has been accepted for publication.

Accepted Manuscripts are published online shortly after acceptance, before technical editing, formatting and proof reading. Using this free service, authors can make their results available to the community, in citable form, before we publish the edited article. This Accepted Manuscript will be replaced by the edited, formatted and paginated article as soon as this is available.

You can find more information about *Accepted Manuscripts* in the **Information for Authors**.

Please note that technical editing may introduce minor changes to the text and/or graphics, which may alter content. The journal's standard <u>Terms & Conditions</u> and the <u>Ethical guidelines</u> still apply. In no event shall the Royal Society of Chemistry be held responsible for any errors or omissions in this *Accepted Manuscript* or any consequences arising from the use of any information it contains.



www.rsc.org/advances

1	
2	The Effect of Temperature on the Dynamics of a
3	Homogeneous Oscillatory System Operated in Batch and
4	Under Flow
5	
6	Paulo A. Nogueira, <sup>1</sup> Bruno C. Batista, <sup>1</sup> Roberto B. Faria, <sup>2,*</sup> Hamilton Varela <sup>1,3,*</sup>
7	
8	<sup>1</sup> Institute of Chemistry of São Carlos, University of São Paulo
9	POBox 780, 13560-970, São Carlos – SP, Brazil
10	<sup>2</sup> Instituto de Química, Universidade Federal do Rio de Janeiro
11	Av. Athos da Silveira Ramos 149, CT, Bloco A, 21941-909, Rio de Janeiro, RJ, Brazil
12	<sup>3</sup> Fritz Haber Institute of the Max Planck Society, Faradayweg 4-6, D-14195 Berlin,
13	Germany
14	
15	
16	Abstract
17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28 29 30 31 32 33 34 25	The effect of temperature on a network of chemical reactions is non-obvious, especially when compared to the effect exerted on elementary steps. There are few reports regarding the estimation of parameters such as activation energies for oscillating chemical systems. Still less investigated is the importance of the relative distance from thermodynamic equilibrium on the way in which temperature influences the oscillators' dynamics – a crucial aspect for the understanding of chemical and bio-chemical oscillating networks. In this paper we use the bromate/oxalic acid and acetone/cerium oscillatory system to study the influence of temperature under close and far-from-equilibrium regimes. The research was carried out under identical conditions for batch and flow (in a continuous flow stirred tank reactor, CSTR) regimes, and the main oscillation features were preserved, so that it was possible to isolate the effect of flow. Overall, increasing the flow results in an increase of the oscillatory frequency. The apparent oscillatory activation energy was found to decrease from $72 \pm 6$ kJ mol <sup>-1</sup> , for the system operated in batch, to $50 \pm 2$ kJ mol <sup>-1</sup> , under flow regime. The role of the distance from the thermodynamic equilibrium on the temperature dependence is generalized and discussed in connection with other systems. Numerical simulations using the Brusselator model under batch and flow regimes further helped the discussion of the main experimental results.
35 36 37 38 20	<i>Keywords</i> : oscillating reactions, temperature, activation energy, batch, CSTR. * Corresponding authors: faria@iq.ufrj.br (RBF) and varela@iqsc.usp.br (HV).

# 40 **1. Introduction**

41 A network of chemical reactions under oscillatory regime might display rather 42 unusual response to temperature changes. Examples include non-Arrhenius behaviors such as temperature compensation and overcompensation.<sup>1,2,3,4-5</sup> These infrequent 43 44 effects play a decisive role, for instance, in temporally organized patterns found in 45 living systems which are commonly known to be rather insensitive to temperature and 46 other parameters such as pH, etc. Temperature compensation is particularly important 47 as part of the wide-ranging homeostatic mechanism, and it underlies many oscillatory 48 mechanisms in living systems (c.f. circadian, ultradian and some neuronal rhythms), c.f. ref.<sup>6</sup> and references therein. In terms of individual reactions, temperature 49 50 compensation results from the balance among the weighted activation energies of 51 frequency-increasing and frequency-decreasing elementary steps in a reaction network.1,2,7 52

Despite the comparable simplicity of chemical oscillators, results obtained in such designed *in vitro* systems can provide valuable information on some structural aspects of more complex and sometimes less tractable biochemical oscillators.<sup>8-9,10</sup> Indeed, the observation of temperature compensation in comparable simpler (electro)chemical oscillators<sup>5, 11-12</sup> attests their importance as model systems. In most cases, the effect of temperature in these oscillators has been discussed in terms of the temperature dependence of the oscillatory frequency, as firstly suggested by Körös.<sup>13</sup>

One of the most prominent feature of living systems is that their internal organization is kept at the expense of exporting entropy to the environment. In order to stay alive, these open systems import (or are fed with) high free energy materials and reject the degraded ones. Already in 1950, von Bertalanffy<sup>14</sup> recognized that "from the physical point of view, the characteristic state of the living organism is that

65 of an open system", and as such, living systems can thrive by "maintaining 66 themselves in exchange of materials with environment, and in continuous building up 67 and breaking down of their components". Therefore, the position with respect to the 68 thermodynamic equilibrium is a key parameter to the understanding and description 69 of the actual state of open systems. In chemical systems, the departure from the state 70 of thermodynamic equilibrium can be tuned by the rate at which reactants are fed and 71 products (and also unreacted species and intermediates) are removed from the 72 reaction vessel. Tuning this parameter results on non-trivial changes in most reaction 73 rates. Hence, the effect exerted by temperature is expected to depend on the distance 74 from thermodynamic equilibrium.

75 A literature survey reveals a lack of reports dealing with the influence of the 76 relative position with respect to thermodynamic equilibrium on the way in which 77 temperature influences the oscillators' dynamics. In a seminal report, Rössler<sup>15</sup> 78 conjectured on the importance of flow when designing a temperature-compensated 79 homogenous chemical oscillator. The discussion was carried out in terms of a 80 theoretical model for a relaxation oscillator. Insofar, however, it seems that no verification of this expectation has been provided. Ruoff and co-workers<sup>16</sup> studied the 81 82 effect of temperature on the dynamics of some bromate oscillators catalyzed by 83 cerium, and reported a considerable decrease in the activation energy when the system 84 was operated in a continuous flow stirred tank reactor (CSTR), when compared with 85 the batch regime. The effect of flow and/or temperature on the dynamics has been 86 reported for some oscillatory such the hydrogen systems as peroxide/thiosulfate/sulfite flow system,<sup>11,17</sup> pH oscillators,<sup>12</sup> and the Bray reaction.<sup>18</sup> 87 We have recently studied<sup>19</sup> the time evolution of the apparent oscillatory activation 88 89 energy for a BZ-like oscillator operated in batch approaches the thermodynamic

90 equilibrium. As the main result, we observed that the apparent oscillatory activation 91 energy increases as reactants are consumed and products accumulate inside the 92 reactor. A detailed investigation of formic acid electro-oxidation on platinum<sup>5</sup> 93 revealed the predominance of highly non-Arrhenius temperature dependence over a 94 wide parameter window. The system was characterized in terms of the distance from 95 the thermodynamic equilibrium and temperature compensation was found to prevail at 96 considerably high applied currents or, equivalently, at the farthest distance from 97 equilibrium.

98 The present contribution results from our interest to understand the combined 99 effect of temperature and distance from the thermodynamic equilibrium. We decided 100 to undergo such an investigation using the bromate-oxalic acid-acetone-cerium system<sup>20,21</sup> as a model system. This system was chosen mainly because of its 101 102 robustness and low sensitivity of its properties, such as the oscillation morphology, on 103 temperature and flow rates. The constancy of such features might indicate that the 104 underlying chemistry remains unchanged at distinct flow rates and temperatures. As 105 far as the effect of temperature is concerned, this system has been studied under both batch and flow regimes.<sup>22,23,24,25</sup> In contrast to previous reports by other authors, 106 107 however, the systematic experiments reported here allowed isolate as much as 108 possible the contribution of the flow on the temperature dependence. We initially 109 optimized the system in order to compare the effect of temperature in batch and flow. 110 In this way, the open and closed systems were studied under identical conditions of 111 stirring rate, temperature, and concentrations. In order to go deeper in the 112 understanding of the distance from the thermodynamic equilibrium on the system's 113 dynamics, we carried out some numerical simulations using the Brusselator model

5

under batch and flow regimes. Finally, the results are discussed in connection withother processes in electro-, bio- and chemical systems.

116

# 117 **2. Experimental Section**

118 The cylindrical glass reactor employed in all experiments is 90 mm high and 119 47 mm in diameter. The temperature was controlled by water circulation through its 120 glass jacket, with the aid of thermostatic bath (Microquimica, model MQBTC99-20) 121 and monitored using a digital thermometer (Tec-Lab). The Teflon reactor cap contains 122 the holes to allow the use of a platinum electrode and a reversible hydrogen electrode. 123 filled with aqueous sulfuric acid solution at identical concentration than that used 124 inside the reactor. The potential difference was followed by means of a multimeter (Minipa, ET2201). Further experimental details can be found elsewhere.<sup>19,26</sup> For open 125 126 reactor experiments (CSTR) two peristaltic pumps (Milan, 640) were used. The 127 system was fed with three aqueous  $H_2SO_4$  solutions: solution A (CH<sub>3</sub>COCH<sub>3</sub> and 128  $(COOH)_2$ , solution B (NaBrO<sub>3</sub>), and solution C (Ce<sub>2</sub>(SO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>). In this case, all solutions 129 were placed in jacketed flasks and kept inside a thermostatic bath to assure the same 130 temperature to that inside the reaction vessel. The solution inside the reactor was 131 mixed by the use of a magnetic stirrer (Marconi, MA089) and a magnetic Teflon bar 132 15 mm long and 5.7 mm of diameter. All experiments were carried out with a stirring 133 rate of 700 rpm.

All chemicals were used as received:  $H_2SO_4$  (Mallinckrodt, AR 96.0 wt %), oxalic acid (Sigma Aldrich, 99,0%), Ce(SO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>2</sub> (Sigma Aldrich, 98%), Ce<sub>2</sub>(SO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub> (Sigma Aldrich, 97%), sodium bromate (Sigma Aldrich, 99%), acetone (J. T. Baker, 99.7%). Ultrapure water (Millipore system, 18.2 M $\Omega$  cm) was used in all solutions and general cleaning.

The oscillating frequency, ω, for each experiment was taken as an average for
the high amplitude set of oscillations, eventually discarding the first or the last value,
if it is out of the range of the others. The frequency of low amplitude oscillations was
not considered because this regime has shown to be more irregular.

143

# 144 **3. Results and Discussion**

## 145 **3.1 Experiments**

146 **Oscillations in batch.** The effect of temperature was firstly investigated in the system 147 operated in batch. Figure 1 shows the time-series for the bromate/oxalic 148 acid/acetone/cerium system operated in batch at different temperatures from 5 to 35 149 °C. As a first noteworthy aspect, it is seen that temperature affects only slightly the 150 morphology of the main, high amplitude, oscillations, suggesting that, in the range 151 investigated, there is no change in the mechanism underlying the oscillatory dynamics. In contrast to what is observed when  $Ce^{4+}$  ions are present, there is no 152 induction period when  $Ce^{3+}$  is used.<sup>26</sup> Moreover, the use of  $Ce^{4+}$  results in 153 considerable scattering in the Arrhenius plots. Therefore, all experiments presented 154 here were carried out with Ce<sup>3+</sup>, performed in triplicate, and all time-series presented 155 156 are representative of the system's dynamics and reproducible.



Figure 1: Time-series of the platinum electrode for the bromate/oxalic acid/acetone/cerium oscillatory system operated in batch at (a) 5, (b) 15, (c) 25 and (d) 35 °C. Initial concentrations:  $[H_2SO_4]_0 = 1.42 \text{ mol L}^1$ 161 <sup>1</sup>;  $[NaBrO_3]_0 = 0.010 \text{ mol } L^{-1}$ ;  $[(COOH)_2]_0 = 0.025 \text{ mol } L^{-1}$ ; 162  $[CH_3COCH_3]_0 = 0.115 \text{ mol } L^{-1}$  and  $[Ce_2(SO_4)_3]_0 = 0.0005 \text{ mol } L^{-1}$ . The 163 vertical line in panel (d) indicates the addition of 0.37 mL of acetone in 164 the reactor vessel.

At 35 °C the system did not oscillate under the given conditions. The addition of a small aliquot (0.37 mL) of acetone at the instant indicated by the vertical line, produced the emergence of transient oscillations, as shown in Figure 1(d). To circumvent the absence of oscillations at 35 °C, we performed experiments with slightly higher acetone concentration, namely 0.157 mol L<sup>-1</sup>, and the results are presented in Figure 2.





174175Figure 2: Time-series of the platinum electrode for the bromate/oxalic176acid/acetone/cerium oscillatory system operated in batch at (a) 5, (b)17715, (c) 25 and (d) 35 °C. Initial concentrations:  $[H_2SO_4]_0 = 1.42 \text{ mol } L^-$ 178^1;  $[NaBrO_3]_0 = 0.010 \text{ mol } L^{-1}; [(COOH)_2]_0 = 0.025 \text{ mol } L^{-1};$ 179 $[CH_3COCH_3]_0 = 0.157 \text{ mol } L^{-1} \text{ and } [Ce_2(SO_4)_3]_0 = 0.0005 \text{ mol } L^{-1}.$ 

181 Overall, the high amplitude oscillations presented in Figures 1 and 2 have 182 comparable waveform and amplitude. Only a small discrepancy in the oscillatory 183 frequency is observed for distinct acetone concentrations. The initial and uniform high 184 amplitude oscillations were used to estimate the apparent oscillatory activation 185 energy. Figure 3 shows the Arrhenius plot for the data presented in Figures 1 and 2, 186 and illustrates the effect of temperature on the dynamics of the bromate/oxalic 187 acid/acetone/cerium oscillatory system. The, apparent oscillatory activation energies,  $E_{\omega}$ , calculated in these plots<sup>13</sup> were found to amount to 72 ± 2 kJ mol<sup>-1</sup> (for 188

 $[CH_3COCH_3] = 0.115 \text{ mol } L^{-1}$ , and to  $74 \pm 1 \text{ kJ mol}^{-1}$  (for  $[CH_3COCH_3] = 0.157 \text{ mol}$ 189 190  $L^{-1}$ ). Experiments were done in triplicate and these results represent the averaged values. Pastapur and Kulkarni<sup>22</sup> studied the effect of temperature in the 191 bromate/oxalic acid/acetone system in batch using  $Ce^{3+}$  and  $Mn^{2+}$ , as catalysts. The 192 193 study was performed at 25, 30, 35, and 40 °C and the activation energy obtained under oscillatory regime for the system with Ce<sup>3+</sup> was 73 or 82 kJ mol<sup>-1</sup>, depending on the 194 195 method used to estimate. The discrepancies between these values and the ones we 196 found in the present work could be attributed to the differences in the concentrations 197 and temperature range used in each case.



198

**Figure 3:** Arrhenius plots using the oscillatory frequency  $\omega$ , for the bromate/oxalic acid/acetone/cerium system operated in batch at two distinct initial concentrations of acetone: 0.115 mol L<sup>-1</sup> (black squares) and 0.157 mol L<sup>-1</sup> (red circles). Other concentrations: [H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>]<sub>0</sub> = 1.42 mol L<sup>-1</sup>; [NaBrO<sub>3</sub>]<sub>0</sub> = 0.010 mol L<sup>-1</sup>; [(COOH)<sub>2</sub>]<sub>0</sub> = 0.025 mol L<sup>-1</sup>; and [Ce<sub>2</sub>(SO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>]<sub>0</sub> = 0.0005 mol L<sup>-1</sup>.

205

An important remark to be done at this point is that although no oscillations were found in batch at 35  $^{\circ}$ C for the lower acetone concentration used, the apparent oscillatory activation energy depicted in Figure 3 (~ 72–74 kJ mol<sup>-1</sup>) is representative of the system operated in batch in the temperature range investigated. The flow

210 experiments were carried out with  $[CH_3COCH_3] = 0.115 \text{ mol } L^{-1}$  and the main results 211 are summarized in the following.

212

213 *Experiments in a CSTR.* As already mentioned, one of the aims of the present work 214 consists in the investigation of the effect that temperature exerts on the systems' 215 dynamics under different regimes, namely the distance from thermodynamic 216 equilibrium. Therefore, the study in the open system started with the investigation of 217 the flow rate effect on the dynamics. The oscillations' morphology and amplitude 218 were barely affected by the flow rate in the range investigated. The effect of the flow 219 rate on the systems dynamics at 25 °C is displayed in Figure 4. The vertical lines 220 indicate the instant at which the flow was interrupted.

- 221
- 222

223

224



Figure 4: The influence of the flow rate on the dynamics of the bromate/oxalic acid/acetone/cerium oscillatory system at 25 °C. [H<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>]<sub>0</sub> = 1.42 mol L<sup>-1</sup>; [NaBrO<sub>3</sub>]<sub>0</sub> = 0.010 mol L<sup>-1</sup>; [(COOH)<sub>2</sub>]<sub>0</sub> = 0.025 mol L<sup>-1</sup>; [CH<sub>3</sub>COCH<sub>3</sub>]<sub>0</sub> = 0.115 mol L<sup>-1</sup>; [Ce<sub>2</sub>(SO<sub>4</sub>)<sub>3</sub>]<sub>0</sub> = 0.0005 mol L<sup>-1</sup>. k<sub>0</sub> = (a) 0.0059 s<sup>-1</sup>, (b) 0.0104 s<sup>-1</sup>, (c) 0.0150 s<sup>-1</sup>, and (d) 0.020 s<sup>-1</sup>.

The observed oscillation periods in this figure were: 97 s (at  $k_0 = 0.0059 \text{ s}^{-1}$ ), 87 s (at  $k_0 = 0.0104 \text{ s}^{-1}$ ), 83 s (at  $k_0 = 0.0150 \text{ s}^{-1}$ ), and 78 s (at  $k_0 = 0.020 \text{ s}^{-1}$ ). Figure 5 summarizes the effect of flow rate on the oscillatory frequency for all experiments. As can be seen, the oscillatory frequency increases, almost linearly, with the flow rate. Data points in batch, i.e.  $k_0 = 0$ , account for three different experiments.

239

240

241



Figure 5: Oscillatory frequency as a function of the flow rate. Identicalconditions as in Figure 4.

247

Our results are in line with that reported by Pereira and Faria.<sup>21</sup> who observed 248 249 a comparable behavior and reported a decrease of about 20 % on the oscillation period for an increase in  $k_0$  from 0.0119 to 0.0352 s<sup>-1</sup>, for the oscillatory bromate-oxalic acid-250 251 acetone-cerium system. General increase of the oscillatory frequency when increasing 252 flow rates has been also found for the hydrogen peroxide/ thiosulfate/sulfite flow system.<sup>11</sup> The difficulty in comparing previously published data is due to the 253 254 commonly observed problem that the system is studied under different conditions 255 (mainly concentration of chemicals) in batch and flow. As already mentioned, this is 256 not a problem in the present case.

In homogeneous systems, the decrease in oscillatory frequency, which follows the reduction of flow rate can be tentatively interpreted as a damping caused by a decrease in the concentration of reacting species and the corresponding reduction of reaction rates of all reactions. As the flow rate increases, the concentrations of reacting species inside the reaction vessel are maintained high because of the efficient replenishment of fresh reactants, and also the removal of products.

263 For most of the homogeneous systems operated in batch, the degree of 264 decrease of the oscillatory frequency in time reflects the strength of the damping; see 265 below more on this aspect. We have explained this phenomenon before in somewhat different terms,<sup>19</sup> but the concept is equivalent in both cases. This is a known effect 266 267 that calls for a special care on the definition of the procedure for estimating the activation energy under oscillatory regime.<sup>27</sup> Moreover, the damping observed in 268 269 batch can also be observed in the oscillation amplitude in addition to the damping in 270 frequency. This interpretation is valid for the same type of oscillations, and thus does not include sequential oscillations witnessed in batch.<sup>19,28,29,30-31</sup> In fact, sequential 271 272 oscillations are dynamics states located at different regions in the phase space that are visited as an uncontrollable parameter slowly varies.<sup>32,33</sup> As such, there is no 273 274 particular trend to be expected for the oscillations' frequency and amplitude in 275 sequential oscillations.

276 When compared to chemical systems, the relative position with respect to the 277 thermodynamic equilibrium in electrochemical systems can be controlled either via potentiostatic or galvanostatic mode.<sup>34</sup> In both cases, the parameter, i.e. the potential 278 279 or the current, respectively, readily informs on the distance with respect to the 280 thermodynamic equilibrium. Nevertheless, the departure from the equilibrium is even 281 more transparent since the flow of electrons through the interface is controlled. In 282 agreement with the present findings, the oscillatory frequency also increases with the applied current for the electro-oxidation of formic acid on platinum<sup>5</sup> and on platinum-283 tin surfaces.<sup>35</sup> Again, these examples are for a situation where the same kind of 284 285 oscillations is compared at different applied currents. As a final observation on the 286 comparison between chemical and electrochemical systems in the context of the 287 present discussion, it is remarkable the peculiarity of chemical systems in the sense

that the situation for  $k_0 = 0$  cannot be obtained in electrochemical systems. Consequently, the range of  $k_0$  explored in Figure 5 is in principle broader than that registered in electrochemical systems. Even considering the problem in properly normalizing the distance from thermodynamic equilibrium, this fact allows for further generalizations.

293 The effect of temperature was also investigated using a system with identical composition as in Figure 4, but with  $k_0 = 0.0098 \text{ s}^{-1}$ . Figure 6 shows the effect of 294 295 temperature on the time-series for the bromate/oxalic acid/acetone/cerium oscillatory 296 system under flow regime. The vertical lines indicate when the flow was stopped. 297 After interrupting the feeding, the system oscillates for a while, just as observed when 298 operated in batch, vide supra. In agreement with the results at 35 °C for the system 299 operated in batch for this acetone concentration, the oscillations die out earlier when 300 the temperature is increased, and as shown in Figure 6(d). As it was observed in 301 batch, a regular, Arrhenius-like behavior is also found for the flow regime and both 302 oscillations' waveform and amplitude remain very similar at all temperatures.



306Figure 6: Time evolution of the bromate/oxalic acid and307acetone/cerium oscillatory system at (a) 5, (b) 15, (c) 25 and (d) 35 °C,308and at  $k_0 = 0.0098 \text{ s}^{-1}$ . Vertical lines indicate when the pumps were309switched off.  $[H_2SO_4]_0 = 1.42 \text{ mol } L^{-1}$ ;  $[NaBrO_3]_0 = 0.010 \text{ mol } L^{-1}$ ;310 $[(COOH)_2]_0 = 0.025 \text{ mol } L^{-1}$ ;  $[CH_3COCH_3]_0 = 0.115 \text{ mol } L^{-1}$ ;311 $[Ce_2(SO_4)_3]_0 = 0.0005 \text{ mol } L^{-1}$ .

312

305

313 The effect of temperature on the oscillatory frequency under both batch and 314 open regimes is summarized in Figure 7(a). The missing point in the data for the batch 315 system accounts for the fact that no oscillations are observed at 35 °C for the lower 316 acetone concentration, c.f. Figure 3. The oscillatory frequencies at different 317 temperatures taken from Figure 6 were used to estimate the activation energy for the CSTR regime.<sup>19</sup> The Arrhenius plots for the CSTR regime are presented in Figure 318 319 7(b). An excellent linearity is observed and an apparent oscillatory activation energy of  $50 \pm 2$  kJ mol<sup>-1</sup> results. 320



**Figure 7:** (a) The effect of temperature on the oscillatory frequency  $\omega$ , for the bromate/oxalic acid/acetone/cerium system operated in batch and also in a CSTR. (b) Arrhenius plots using the oscillatory frequency,  $\omega$ , for the system operated in a CSTR. Data for experiments in batch as in Figure 1 and for the open system as in Figure 6.

As already anticipated in Figure 5, it is clear from Figure 7(a) that the open system oscillates faster than the one operated in batch, for the whole range of temperature studied. The apparent oscillatory activation energy decreases from  $72 \pm 2$ kJ mol<sup>-1</sup>, in batch, to  $50 \pm 2$  kJ mol<sup>-1</sup> under flow. As the batch regime is virtually at k<sub>0</sub> **RSC Advances Accepted Manuscript** 

339 = 0, if other  $k_0$  values higher than 0.0098 s<sup>-1</sup> were employed an oscillatory activation 340 energy still lower should be find. These two aspects are central in the present study 341 and will be further discussed below.

342 Experimental results for other systems are in line with our findings, as already mentioned in the Introduction.<sup>16,19</sup> Nogueira *et al.*<sup>19</sup> in particular, clearly show the 343 344 increase of the apparent oscillatory activation energy as the system approaches the 345 thermodynamic equilibrium. As already stressed, in order to isolate as much as 346 possible the effects of interest, namely the operation mode and temperature, it is 347 mandatory to keep, if possible, all the other parameters constant, as in the present 348 case. In this respect, we are not aware of a comparable report. Taking specifically the work by Kulkarni and co-workers,<sup>22-,23,24,25</sup> who investigated the effect of temperature 349 350 under comparable conditions for the same system studied here, besides the different 351 concentrations used in some experiments in batch and under flow, the authors also used Ce<sup>4+</sup> as the catalyst in some experiments, and this might lead to misleading 352 results. In fact, we have shown that  $Ce^{3+}$  is the needed catalyst to observe oscillations 353 in the bromate-oxalic acid-acetone-cerium system.<sup>21,26</sup> In batch, no induction period is 354 observed when Ce<sup>3+</sup> is used, and in a CSTR, oscillations were found with Ce<sup>3+</sup> and 355 with aged solution of  $Ce^{4+}$ , after partial conversion of  $Ce^{4+}$  to  $Ce^{3+}$  by reaction with 356 acetone. The use of  $Ce^{4+}$  results in long induction times and leads to imprecision. In 357 358 terms of the influence of temperature, we have observed that the Arrhenius plots are less linear when  $Ce^{4+}$  is used instead of  $Ce^{3+}$ . 359

Back to the main results, in summary, we observed that, as the system is moved out from the state of thermodynamic equilibrium, its oscillatory frequency generally increases and its apparent oscillatory activation energy decreases. The first aspect, the frequency increasing with the distance from equilibrium was already

364 discussed. We focus now on the temperature dependence, as discussed in terms of 365 apparent activation energy for the oscillatory system. The activation energy of an 366 elementary reaction step accounts for the energy barrier that molecules have to 367 overcome in order to form products. For more complex processes, however, the 368 presence of different steps and intermediates results in the existence of several energy 369 barriers. In the case of an oscillating network consisting of many reactions and 370 chemical species, the apparent oscillatory activation energy, as measured by the 371 oscillatory frequency, informs on the temperature dependence of the oscillator, as it is based on a single reaction. As presented by Körös,<sup>13</sup> the system can be regarded as 'a 372 373 series of autocatalytic reaction bursts occurring with a certain frequency'. In our case, 374 the apparent oscillatory activation energy decrease as the system is kept far from 375 equilibrium, and it is equivalent to saying that it becomes less sensitive to temperature 376 changes. As a consequence, the relative independence of the physiological rhythms in 377 living systems on the environmental temperature, known as temperature 378 compensation, might indeed be favored under significantly far from equilibrium regime. It is well-known that dynamic self-organization,<sup>36</sup> such as the temporally 379 380 organized rhythms, that characterizes all living structures, occurs only in open and far 381 from equilibrium systems. What our results reinforce is that the distance from 382 equilibrium favors the decrease of temperature sensitivity.

Curiously enough, but also in line with our observations, our previous study on the electro-oxidation of formic acid on platinum and in acidic media,<sup>5</sup> showed that, even for a system having a highly non-Arrhenius temperature dependence, temperature compensation is found under considerably far from equilibrium regime.

387 The role of flow in the temperature compensation has been explored by Otto
388 Rössler in an often cited proceeding paper.<sup>15</sup> The author discusses the temperature-

389 sensitivity as resulting of a combination of kinetic and flow parameters and draw 390 some particular conditions for achieving temperature compensation for the case 391 studied, namely a relaxation oscillator. Importantly, the author mentions the role 392 eventually played by membranes. In bio-systems, membranes are key components 393 that control the inflow and outflow of species and preserve the internal organization 394 by keeping the system under far from equilibrium regime. However, besides the 395 magnitude of flow itself, the selectivity, or its effect on particular species, is also a 396 key aspect when discussing properties such as the temperature dependence on the 397 oscillatory frequency. This aspect will be further discussed below.

In the following we present some numerical results that explore some aspects raised by our experiments. Given the lack of a well-established model for the studied system, we used a general and very simple model to investigate the effect of flow and temperature.

402

#### 403 **3.2** Numerical solutions of the Brusselator model

The chosen model to test the ideas just discussed was the Brusselator,<sup>37,38</sup> a very simple, classical example of a limit cycle oscillator. The model consists of the following hypothetical steps:

$$A \rightarrow X$$
(1)  

$$B + X \rightarrow Y + D$$
(2)  

$$Y + 2X \rightarrow 3X$$
(3)  

$$X \rightarrow E$$
(4)

where A and B are the initial reactants whose concentrations are assumed to be
constant, D and E are final products, X and Y are intermediate species that oscillate
under a suitable choice of the rate of reactions and initial concentrations of A and B.
This mechanism can be translated to a set of differential equations:

$$\frac{dX}{dt} = k_1 * A_0 - k_2 * B_0 * X + k_3 * X^2 * Y - k_4 * X$$
$$\frac{dY}{dt} = k_2 * B_0 * X - k_3 * X^2 * Y$$
ODE 1

412 These equations describe how the concentrations of the two intermediate 413 species X and Y change as a function of their concentration and that of the initial reactants A and B. In the original formulation of the Brusselator model,<sup>37,38</sup> [A] and 414 415 [B] are held constant which implies continuous inflow for those species, and the 416 system represents, thus, a semi-batch oscillator. In our case, the original equations 417 were modified to directly incorporate the effect of reactant inflow and outflow fluxes, 418 as we shall describe in the following. Specific routines were built using the Mathematica<sup>®</sup> software to solve the resulting ODEs as well as analyze the resulting 419 420 time series as a function of selected parameter changes. Runge-Kutta with variable 421 step size was the preferred method for numerical integration.

422

423 *The effect of the flow.* In order to explicitly incorporate the effect of the flow of 424 reactants in a continuously fed well-stirred tank reactor (CSTR) it is necessary to add 425 two other equations accounting for the addition and removal of the initial reactants A 426 and B, where  $k_f$  stands for the flow rate:

427

$$\frac{dA}{dt} = k_f * A_0 - k_1 * A - k_f * A$$

$$\frac{dB}{dt} = k_f * B_0 - k_2 * B * X - k_f * B$$
ODE 2

428

The final set of equations describing the CSTR system can be achieved with a minor
intervention on the original ODEs to account for the removal of the intermediate
species. The final set of equations for the CSTR oscillator then becomes:

$$\frac{dA}{dt} = k_f * A_0 - k_1 * A - k_f * A$$
$$\frac{dB}{dt} = k_f * B_0 - k_2 * B * X - k_f * B$$
$$\frac{dX}{dt} = k_1 * A - k_2 * B * X + k_3 * X^2 * Y - k_4 * X - k_f * X$$
$$\frac{dY}{dt} = k_2 * B * X - k_3 * X^2 * Y - k_f * Y$$

Δ	2	2
т	J	J

Oscillations may be found for this system of equations after numerical integration and a sensible choice of the parameters. In what follows, the values of  $A_0$ and  $B_0$  were fixed at 20, and the oscillatory frequency analyzed as a function of the flow rate,  $k_{fi}$ , for some selected sets of the constants { $k_1,k_2,k_3,k_4$ } which were representative of the overall model behavior. Numerical results of the effect of the flux of reactants through the reactor on the oscillatory frequency are displayed in Figure 8.

441

442

443



Figure 8: Simulated dependency of the oscillatory frequency on the parameter  $k_f$  that represents the flux of reactants through the reactor (set ODE 3). The curves were obtained for several sets of the rate constants  $\{k_1,k_2,k_3,k_4\}$ , indicated in the insert.

451 The majority of curves presented in Figure 8 reveal a general increase in the 452 values of oscillatory frequency as the flow rate increases, in line with our 453 experimental findings, c.f. Figure 5. This behavior was found for six combinations of 454 the rate constants  $\{k_1, k_2, k_3, k_4\}$  and for the whole range of flow in which oscillations 455 exists. One exception was found for the set  $\{1,2,1,3\}$ , but the deviation occurs only 456 for a very high  $k_f$ , namely  $k_f$  higher than 0.5 s<sup>-1</sup>, i.e. in an extreme parameter region. In 457 terms of the mechanism, the decrease of oscillatory frequency when increasing the 458 flow rate was found only for a combination of the smallest value for the rate of step 1 459  $(A \rightarrow X)$  with the highest value for the rate of step 4  $(X \rightarrow E)$ , and only for very high 460 flow rates. Under these conditions the decrease of the oscillatory frequency can be 461 attributed to the small concentrations of X (low formation and fast removal) and also 462 to its low residence time within the reactor. Finally, we observed that the range of 463 flow rate in which oscillations can be found generally increases with the decrease of 464 k<sub>3</sub> and with the increase of k<sub>4</sub>. It was mentioned in the experimental section that, in

23

batch, a possible explanation for the slower dynamics was the general decrease in the concentration of active species caused by their consumption in a closed system. This effect is absent in our simulations since we used constant concentrations for A and B in the simulations for the original Brusselator, which prevents any damping and produces only stable oscillations as for the system under explicit flow.

470 As seen in the set ODE 3, the flow rate parameter  $k_f$  is found to impact several 471 terms of the differential equations' set. It is possible to evaluate how each one of these 472 terms affects the overall oscillatory frequency. To do so, we can discriminate each  $k_{fi}$ 473 which appear in the set ODE 4:

474

$$\frac{dA}{dt} = k_{f1} * A_0 - k_1 * A - k_{f2} * A$$
$$\frac{dB}{dt} = k_{f3} * B_0 - k_2 * B * X - k_{f4} * B$$
$$\frac{dX}{dt} = k_1 * A - k_2 * B * X + k_3 * X^2 * X - k_4 * X - k_{f5} * X$$
$$\frac{dY}{dt} = k_2 * B * X - k_3 * X^2 * Y - k_{f6} * Y$$

475

476 Altogether, there are six flow rate terms, four of them which increase ( $k_{fl}$  and 477  $k_{f3}$ ) and decrease ( $k_{f2}$  and  $k_{f4}$ ) the concentrations of A and B, and two related with the 478 withdraw of the intermediate species X and Y ( $k_{f5}$  and  $k_{f6}$ ). We can vary each of those 479  $k_{fi}$  individually while keeping the remaining values constant at a control value. It is 480 important to note, at this point, that this is merely a mathematical procedure, aiming 481 to explore how these parameters, individually, influence the overall oscillatory 482 dynamics for the model, and that there is no direct physical counterpart associated to a 483 variation on a specific value of k<sub>fi</sub>, since it would violate volume conservation. Still, 484 one can see the variation in those parameters as a mean of increasing or decreasing 485 the relative abundances of the reactants A, B, X, and Y. With this thought in mind,

and the tool in hands, important insights can be achieved as of the role of availabilityof each of the reactant and its effect on oscillatory properties.

Figure 9 shows the effect of the variation of each  $k_{fi}$  value on the oscillatory frequency for the CSTR version of the Brusselator. On panel (a) the results of such procedure are shown for values of  $k_{fi}$  starting from a low flow rate value ( $k_0 = 40$ ), while (b) displays the results for a high flow rate value ( $k_0 = 200$ ). The set of four  $k_i$ values used were {1,2,1,2}, but the general trend is similar for other sets of  $k_i$ .

493

494

495

496





**Figure 9:** The curve in black shows how oscillatory frequency depends on the flow rate for the CSTR version of the Brusselator model using the  $\{1,2,1,2\}$  rate constants set. The colorful lines indicate the dependency of the oscillatory frequency on the individual rate constants  $k_{fi}$  found in the set ODE 4, at low and high flow values,  $k_0 = 40$  in (a), and  $k_0 = 200$  in (b).  $A_0 = B_0 = 20$ .

508 Figure 9 shows that each different constant is associated with different effects 509 on the oscillatory frequency. A common feature, however, is that a given rate constant 510 plays the same role either at low or high flow rate. It is possible to quantify the 511 magnitude of individual flow rate parameters  $k_{fi}$  on the overall behavior of frequency 512 by introducing a sensitivity coefficient. Such coefficients have been used in biological 513 contexts to evaluate the response of specific living organelles' functions for variations of important chemical species or physical parameters such as temperature.<sup>39</sup> In our 514 515 specific case, it is intuitive to introduce the sensitivity coefficient for the oscillatory 516 frequency:

.

$$\mathbf{S}_{k_{f,i}}^{\omega} = \left(\frac{\partial \omega}{\partial k_{f,i}}\right)_{k_{f,i} \to k_{f,contro}}$$

517 Here, a specific sensitivity coefficient S  $^{\omega}_{kf,i}$  relates how the oscillatory 518 frequency  $\omega$  changes as function of a variation on a specific flow rate parameter k<sub>f.i</sub>. 519 The partial derivative is evaluated in the vicinities of the control flow rate, rendering 520 thus a special physical meaning to the sensitivity coefficients, since the change in 521 volume of the reactor is infinitesimal for that limit. 522 Table I presents the overall dependency of the oscillatory frequency on the increase in 523 each of the  $k_{fi}$  constants as well as the specific control coefficients. It can be seen that 524 parameters  $k_{fl}$  and  $k_{f2}$  related with the addition and removal of A, respectively,

525 increase and decrease the oscillatory frequency. On the other hand, parameters  $k_{f3}$  and 526  $k_{f4}$ , associated with the addition and removal of B, display the opposite effect. This 527 result is in accordance with the simulated original Brusselator system where 528 integration of the original ODE 1 set reveals that an increase in the concentration of A 529 leads to higher oscillatory frequencies, while an increase for B promotes the opposite 530 trend. Finally, Table I shows that an increase in the values of  $k_{f5}$  and  $k_{f6}$  promotes a 531 decrease in oscillatory frequency, which means that depletion on the concentration of 532 the intermediates X and Y has a negative effect on this property.

533



Table I: Dependence of oscillatory frequency on the variation of individual constants associated with flow rate.

Parameter	Effect on $\omega$	$S^{\omega}{}_{kf,i\rightarrow40}$	$S^{\omega}{}_{kf,i\rightarrow200}$
$k_{fl}$	(+)	+ 3.6	+ 4.0
k <sub>f2</sub>	↓ (-)	- 0.19	- 0.71
k <sub>f3</sub>	↓ (-)	- 2.7	- 1.5
k <sub>f4</sub>	↑ (+)	+0.34	+0.088
k <sub>f5</sub>	↓ (-)	- 0.33	- 0.19
k <sub>f6</sub>	↓ (-)	- 0.75	- 0.33
k <sub>f,total</sub>	↑ (+)	+0.99	+ 1.4

536

537 In this way, we can see that the individual flow rate parameter operates on 538 several terms of the set of differential equations and that each one of them has a

27

539 particular effect on the oscillatory frequency, since it is specifically associated to the 540 increase/withdraw of a particular reactant. Back to our specific results, a closer look 541 in Figure 9 reveals that the constants  $k_{f1}$  and  $k_{f3}$  related to the addition of reactants A 542 and B, respectively, display the most pronounced effect on frequency, with  $k_{fl}$ 543 promoting its increase while  $k_{\beta}$  producing its decrease. Thus we can explain the 544 overall increase of frequency as the flow rate is increased (curve in black in Figure 9), 545 as a function of a higher weight of the term related with  $k_{fl}$ . In summary, the results 546 shown in Figure 9 can be rationalized as the net increase in the oscillatory frequency 547 is a result of an increasingly surplus of the initial reactant A.

548 As represented by the black curve in Figure 9, simple experiments in a CSTR 549 would result in overall increase of the oscillatory frequency with the increase in the 550 flow rate. The selective removal or addition of a given species in the reaction network 551 would result in the increase or decrease of the oscillatory frequency. An interesting 552 aspect that emerges from these results consists of the opposite effects exerted by the 553 removal or addition of a given species. This feature opens the possibility of exploring 554 the selective role of a given species to achieve properties such as temperature 555 compensation. Indeed, the high selectivity of cellular membrane might play a role in 556 keeping unaltered biological rhythms despite of changes in the environment. The 557 importance of the interactions between membrane ion transport and ion concentration 558 gradients in circadian rhythms has been discussed in the Njus-Sulzman-Hastings or membrane model.<sup>40</sup> Despite the criticisms to some aspects of this earlier model, 559 Nitabach *et al.*<sup>41</sup> stressed the essential role that the ion fluxes through the membrane 560 561 play in the mechanism of the core oscillator. Therefore, this discussion suggests that, 562 instead of the robustness of a given biochemical network, it would be thus more 563 adequate to consider the confined system (chemistry and membrane) as whole. The

use of methods to investigate the reaction mechanism in complex systems<sup>42,43</sup> is
certainly of help in this direction.

566

567 *The effect of temperature.* Temperature variation will affect directly the overall 568 oscillatory frequency through its influence on each specific reaction rates  $k_i$ . This 569 effect can be mathematically treated through the use of control coefficients:<sup>1,2,3-4</sup>

570 
$$C_{k_i}^{\omega} = \frac{\partial ln\omega}{\partial lnk_i}$$
 e1

571 The overall effect of temperature on frequency can be understood as the sum:

572 
$$\frac{\partial ln\omega}{\partial T} = \sum_{i=1}^{4} \frac{\partial ln\omega}{\partial lnk_i} * \frac{\partial lnk_i}{\partial T} \qquad e2$$

573 Through reference to Arrhenius' law, the following equation can be derived:

574 
$$\frac{\partial lnk_i}{\partial T} = \frac{Ea_i}{RT^2}$$
 e3

575 Which finally produces:

576 
$$\frac{\partial \ln \omega}{\partial T} = \frac{1}{RT^2} * \sum_{i=1}^4 C_{k_i}^{\omega} * Ea_i \qquad e4$$

577 Here it is possible to see that each specific reaction will influence the overall
578 frequency change with respect to its specific control coefficient and activation energy.
579 The overall activation energy can be calculated as:

e5

$$E_{\omega} = \sum_{i=1}^{4} C_{k_i}^{\omega} * Ea_i$$

581 For the Brusselator model, this expression actually translates into:

582 
$$E_{\omega} = (C_{k_1}^{\omega} * Ea_1 + C_{k_2}^{\omega} * Ea_2 + C_{k_3}^{\omega} * Ea_3 + C_{k_4}^{\omega} * Ea_4) \quad e6,$$

which indicates how the apparent oscillatory activation energy relates with the activation energies of individual steps. Figure 10 portraits the influence of the reaction rates on the oscillatory frequency for the CSTR version of the Brusselator model.

586

587



Figure 10: Influence of each  $k_i$  on the oscillatory frequency for the CSTR version of the Brusselator model, set ODE 3 with  $k_f = 0.10 \text{ s}^{-1}$ . Each rate constant was varied individually while the others would obey the following set {1,2,1,2}.  $A_0 = B_0 = 20$ .

Results in Figure 10 describe the impact of the rate constants on the oscillatory frequency. Coefficients  $C_{k_i}^{\omega}$  were estimated and indicate that: steps 1  $(A \rightarrow X)$  and 3  $(Y + 2X \rightarrow 3X)$  contribute to increase the oscillatory frequency as the temperature increases, whereas steps 2  $(B + X \rightarrow Y + D)$  and 4  $(X \rightarrow E)$  belong to the frequency decreasing set. In short, steps that produce X increase the oscillatory frequency and the ones that consume X decrease the oscillatory frequency. In general, this trend was also found for almost all combinations of constants investigated.

According to equation (e6), the apparent oscillatory activation energy for the Brusselator model would thus result of positive contributions of the activation energies of steps 1 and 3, and negative ones of steps 2 and 4. The impact of individual rate constants on the oscillatory frequency can be readily compared to the role of

selective feeding of different species discussed above. For instance, saying that step steps 1 ( $A \rightarrow X$ ) contributes to increase the oscillatory frequency as the temperature increases, as evidenced by its positive control coefficient, is equivalent to the observation that the addition/removal of species A contributes to the increase/decrease of the oscillatory frequency, as discussed above.

612

# 613 4. Summary and Conclusions

614 We investigate in this article the coupled effects of temperature and of the 615 distance from thermodynamic equilibrium on the dynamics of a homogeneous 616 oscillatory system. Experiments were carried out with the bromate/oxalic acid and 617 acetone/cerium system under different temperatures and flow rates, by means of a 618 continuous flow stirred tank reactor (CSTR). The conclusions on the effect of the 619 distance from thermodynamics equilibrium was validated by the nearly identical 620 oscillation's features under both batch and flow regimes. The experimental results 621 were discussed in connection with numerical simulations using the Brusselator model, 622 in its conventional formulation and also in a modified one to explicitly include the 623 effect of flow.

624 The experiments reveal a general increase of the oscillatory frequency when 625 the flow rate is increased, in line with our previously published experiments in some 626 homogeneous (chemical) and also heterogeneous (electrochemical) oscillators. 627 Numerical simulations with the CSTR version of the Brusselator confirm this 628 tendency but also disclose a tiny parameter region (for one specific set of rate 629 constants and at extremely high flow rates) in which the increase of the flow rate 630 results in a decrease in the oscillatory frequency. The effect of flow rate was also 631 explored for each species of the Brusselator. Remarkably, we observed that, although

the increase of the flow rate typically increases the oscillatory frequency, the feed concentration of each species impacts in a particular way the overall oscillatory frequency. This finding further stresses the role of flow rate in reacting systems, an important aspect for engineering artificial oscillators for specific applications.

636 The apparent oscillatory activation energy obtained via Arrhenius plots using 637 the oscillatory frequency, was found to amount to  $72 \pm 6$  kJ mol<sup>-1</sup>, in batch, and to 50 638  $\pm$  2 kJ mol<sup>-1</sup>, under flow. Unlike previous reports, these results were obtained under 639 identical concentrations of all species and thus allowed to separate the effects of flow 640 and temperature dependence. The decrease of the apparent oscillatory activation 641 energy from batch to flow was interpreted as a result of the maintenance of the 642 concentration of reactants, in contrast to their decrease caused by their consumption in batch, which is in line with our previous results.<sup>19</sup> Numerical simulations with the 643 644 CSTR version of the Brusselator were explored in terms of the control coefficients,  $\partial ln\omega/\partial lnk_i$ , <sup>1,2,3-4</sup> for each reaction step *i* of the model. The results uncover the 645 646 existence of two steps that are associated to the frequency-increasing set and two to 647 the frequency-decreasing one, whose role remains unchanged despite the operational 648 conditions. Furthermore, and as already mentioned, the particular manner at which the 649 feeding rate of each species affects the oscillatory frequency further reinforces the 650 role played by the selectivity of biological membranes in this respect.

651

652

653

654

655

- 657
- 658
- 659
- 660
- 661
- 662
- 663

# 665 Acknowledgements

- 666 PAN, BCB (#141723/2009-2), RBF (#303988/2009-6, and #479897/2010-7), and HV
- 667 (#306151/2010-3, and #479897/2010-7) acknowledge Conselho Nacional de
- 668 Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico (CNPq) for financial support. HV
- acknowledges São Paulo Research Foundation (FAPESP) for financial support (grants
- 670 #2009/07629-6 and #2012/24152-1).
- 671

672 673	References		
674			
675			
676	1.	P. Ruoff, J Interdiscipl Cycle Res, 1992, 23, 92-99.	
677	2.	P. Ruoff, Naturwissenschaften, 1994, 81, 456-459.	
678	3.	P. Ruoff, <i>Physica D</i> , 1995, <b>84</b> , 204-211.	
679	4.	P. Ruoff, L. Rensing, R. Kommedal and S. Mohsenzadeh, Chronobiol Int,	
680		1997, <b>14</b> , 499-510.	
681	5.	R. Nagao, I. R. Epstein, E. R. Gonzalez and H. Varela, J Phys Chem A, 2008,	
682		<b>112</b> , 4617-4624.	
683	6.	P. Ruoff and L. Rensing, Journal of Thermal Biology, 2004, 29, 445-456.	
684	7.	L. Rensing, S. Mohsenzadeh, P. Ruoff and U. Meyer, Chronobiol Int, 1997,	
685		<b>14</b> , 481-498.	
686	8.	H. L. Heathcote, Zeitschrift Fur Physikalische ChemieStochiometrie Und	
687		Verwandtschaftslehre, 1901, <b>37</b> , 368-373.	

688	9.	G. Bredig and J. Weinmayr, Zeitschrift Fur Physikalische Chemie
689		Stochiometrie Und Verwandtschaftslehre, 1903, 42, 601-611.
690	10.	H. Varela, <i>Ciência e Cultura</i> , 2011, <b>63</b> , 23-25.
691	11.	G. Rabai and I. Hanazaki, Chem Commun, 1999, 1965-1966.
692	12.	K. M. Kovacs and G. Rabai, Phys Chem Chem Phys, 2002, 4, 5265-5269.
693	13.	E. Koros, <i>Nature</i> , 1974, <b>251</b> , 703-704.
694	14.	L. von Bertalanffy, Science, 1950, 111, 23-29.
695	15.	O. E. Rössler, Steps toward a temperature-compensated homogeneous
696		chemical clock. San Diego, 1975
697	16.	G. Nagy, E. Koros, N. Oftedal, K. Tielflaat and P. Ruoff, <i>Chem Phys Lett.</i>
698		1996. <b>250</b> . 255-260.
699	17.	G. Rabai and I. Hanazaki, J Phys Chem A, 1999, 103, 7268-7273.
700	18.	K. Kovacs, L. L. Hussami and G. Rabai, J Phys Chem A, 2005, 109, 10302-
701		10306
702	19	P A Nogueira H C L Oliveira and H Varela J Phys Chem A 2008 112
703		12412-12415
704	20	Z Noszticzius Magyar Kemiai Folyoirat 1979 <b>85</b> 330-331
705	21	J A M Pereira and R B Faria J Brazil Chem. Soc. 2004 15 976-978
706	22	S M Pastapur and V R Kulkarni <i>J. Ind. Chem. Soc.</i> 1991 <b>68</b> 293-294
707	23	C Basavaraja and V R Kulkarni <i>J. Ind. Chem. Soc.</i> 2004 <b>81</b> 427-429
708	23. 24	C Basavaraja and V R Kulkarni J. Ind. Chem. Soc. 2006 83 85-86
709	25	C Basavaraja D S Huh S H Park U J Jeon R Pierson T K
710	-0.	Vishnuvardhan and V R Kulkarni <i>Bulletin of the Korean Chemical Society</i>
711		2007 <b>28</b> 1489-1492
712	26	P A Nogueira H Varela and R B Faria Chem Phys Lett. 2012 530 137-
713		139.
714	27	S Anic L KolarAnic and E Koros <i>Reac. Kin. Cat. Lett.</i> 1997 <b>61</b> 111-116
715	28	L Adamcikova and P Sevcik <i>Reac Kin Cat Lett</i> 1995 <b>56</b> 137-142
716	29	M Rachwalska Z Naturforsch A 2007 62 41-55
717	30	J Li and J C Wang Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys. 2011 <b>13</b> 15539-15545
718	31.	J. G. Bell and J. Wang, <i>Chaos</i> , 2013, <b>23</b> , 033120.
719	32	R Nagao E Sitta and H Varela J Phys Chem C 2010 114 22262-22268
720	33.	M. F. Cabral, R. Nagao, E. Sitta, M. Eiswirth and H. Varela, <i>Phys. Chem.</i>
721		Chem. Phys. 2013. 15, 1437-1442.
722	34.	H. Varela, <i>ChemistryOpen</i> , 2012, <b>1</b> , 165-168.
723	35.	N. Perini, E. Sitta, A. C. D. Angelo and H. Varela, <i>Catal. Commun.</i> , 2013, <b>30</b> .
724		23-26.
725	36.	G. M. Whitesides and B. Grzybowski, <i>Science</i> , 2002, <b>295</b> , 2418-2421.
726	37	I Prigogine and R Lefever J Chem. Phys. 1968 48 1695-1700
727	38.	P. Grav, S. K. Scott and J. H. Merkin, J. Chem. Soc. Faradav Trans., 1988.
728		<b>84</b> , 993-1012.
729	39.	J. Wolf, S. Becker-Weimann and R. Heinrich, Systems Biology, 2005, 2, 35-
730		41.
731	40.	D. Nius, F. M. Sulzman and J. W. Hastings, <i>Nature</i> , 1974, <b>248</b> , 116-120.
732	41.	M. N. Nitabach, T. C. Holmes and J. Blau, <i>Method Enzymol.</i> , 2005, <b>393</b> , 682-
733	-	693.
734	42.	A. Lemarchand, H. Berthoumieux, L. Jullien and C. Gosse, J. Phys. Chem. A.
735		2012, <b>116</b> , 8455-8463.
736	43.	X. Li and A. B. Kolomeisky, J. Chem. Phys., 2013. 139. 144106.
737		



Dependence of the oscillation frequency on the temperature under flow and batch regimes